

# SCHOOLING IN THE CISKEI

BY

HEATHER JACKLIN

1994

## FOREWORD

In 1994 educationist Heather Jacklin and sociologist Johann Graaff, both from the University of Cape Town, completed reports on rural education in each of the ten the homelands, and then a summary report – eleven reports in all. The overarching title of the set of reports was to have been *Rural education in South Africa: a report on schooling in the Bantustans*. Unfortunately the reports were never published, although photocopies did find their way to some researchers.

The titles and authors of the eleven reports are:

- Final report on homeland education (Jacklin and Graaff)
- Is Bop better? A case-study in educational innovation (Graaff)
- Schooling in KaNgwane (Jacklin)
- Inherit the wind: a report on education in Lebowa (Jacklin)
- Education as an instrument of war: the case of KwaZulu/Natal (Graaff)
- Schooling in KwaNdebele (Jacklin)
- Schooling in the Ciskei (Jacklin)
- Teachers without classrooms: education in Venda (Graaff)
- Klein maar getrain: education in QwaQwa (Graaff)
- Schooling in Gazankulu (Jacklin)
- Rural Education Project report: Transkei (Jacklin)

Linda Chisholm of the University of Johannesburg was one of the researchers who obtained a ring-bound photocopy of the eleven reports, and she has used them in her own research. She deemed them valuable enough to warrant digitizing, and in 2017 made the suggestion to me by way of her sister Alison (my deputy). Indeed, nothing as comprehensive as these reports had been published on education in the homelands. Further, though unpublished, a number of these reports have been cited.

In 2018 I was given the go-ahead to place them on the Wits institutional repository. Both Heather Jacklin and Johann Graaff readily gave Wits permission to do so. Heather also kindly provided MS Word copies of the present report, Ciskei, and of KwaNdebele, which we could turn into PDFs.

Mark Sandham  
Education Librarian  
University of the Witwatersrand  
August 2018.

## **SCHOOLING IN THE CISKEI**

### **SECTION A: POLITICAL, SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC CONTEXT**

At the Ciskei's independence celebrations at the Bisho stadium in 1981 the flagpole fell over. This was to prove portentous: for the next thirteen years until the Ciskei was absorbed into a new Eastern Cape province, the region was to experience little peace or stability. The bus boycotts in Mdantsane involved the greatest numbers, but there was also ongoing resistance to incorporation of adjacent areas and against the relocation of people into the Ciskei. Appropriately, the event which heralded the end of the independent status of the bantustan - the massacre of ANC protest marchers in September 1992 - occurred at the same ill fated Bisho stadium. Southall has argued that this event not only signalled the end of independence for the Ciskei but that it also nudged South Africa closer to a political settlement which would end the bantustan system as a whole (Southall 1993).

Ciskei was one of the more troubled and also one of the better resourced of the bantustans. Its residents benefited from proximity to East London and Port Elizabeth. The new class of 'salarisats' which developed in all former bantustans, consisting primarily of government bureaucrats, was supplemented by those employed in the neighbouring metropolis (De Wet, Manona and Palmer).

Even though betterment schemes generally undermined the viability of agricultural activities in the eighties, land was still held on a freehold system in some areas, giving landholders the opportunity to develop a more stable economic base (De Wet, Manona and Palmer 1992). Ciskeians also benefitted from better social services in areas such as health. In 1989 per capita health spending was higher in the Ciskei than in any other bantustan and more than twice that of each of the other three TBVC states (Segar 1993). Consequently Ciskei has achieved an average of 8 000 people per clinic which is considerably better than the 10 000 people per clinic which the World Health Organisation regards as an acceptable level (Southall 1993). Segar points out that Ciskeians have had the additional advantage of being close to health facilities in towns outside the region.

Education spending in the Ciskei, Venda and Bophuthatswana (but not Transkei) have tended to be higher than in the self-governing territories (SAIRR 1986 - 1992). In addition to normal funds earmarked for education, the South African Foreign Affairs Department embarked on an extensive school building programme in the Ciskei from 1985 which was not equalled in any\* of the other former bantustans. (This programme is described in the DFA Phase Four Report, which is discussed more fully below. \*I do not know whether there is an equivalent in Venda). Education in the Ciskei has also benefitted from considerable NGO education activity reaching into the Ciskei from East London, Grahamstown and Port Elizabeth. Extensive Educare provision by a network of centres under the auspices of the Border Early Learning Centre provides perhaps the best example of supportive NGO work in the Ciskei. At post secondary level, Ciskeians have been able to make use of post-secondary institutions in South African towns in addition to its own Fort Hare University. Although this institution never had the resources associated with non-bantustan universities it has still placed the Ciskei in a better position than those former bantustans which had no tertiary institutions or which only had satellites of other universities.

In spite of these social, economic and educational advantages - or perhaps because of them - resistance against the bantustan leadership and political system never abated in the Ciskei. In 1990 a wave of opposition to the independence of the Ciskei culminated in a coup which toppled Sebe's government and introduced Gqozo's military government. The coup was followed, in the short term, by the abolition of the system of headmen and the virtual collapse of the Tribal Authority system which could not operate without the headmen. These were replaced (to a lesser or greater degree in different areas) by the establishment of local government by Civics and Residents' Associations. Within a year, however, Gqozo began to re-instate the headmen. From 1991 to 1994 Gqozo withdrew into an increasingly repressive position while contestation for power continued to play itself out in different ways at the local level. By the end of 1992, Gqozo was clearly allied to the Nationalist Government, KwaZulu and Bophuthatswana at Codesa, unlike Venda, Transkei, Lebowa, KaNgwane and KwaNdebele which had all allied themselves with the ANC. The positive relationship with the South African government bore fruits in the scale of annual grants which averaged R1 120 per person in 1992, compared to an average of R550 in the neighbouring Transkei (Keeton 1992, NLS 1990).

## **EDUCATION AND RESISTANCE**

The struggles in the Ciskei were different from those in many other bantustans in that they did not take specifically educational forms. Nevertheless, different elements of the educational system were intertwined in the contestation over local government. Firstly, educational issues were central to grievances about the ineffectiveness of the Chiefs' councils. The responsibilities of the Traditional Authorities included the promotion of education, the erection and maintenance of schools and the granting of bursaries and loans to scholars. Although the councils had small annual budgets allocated by the Ciskei government, these did not make provision for schools and these responsibilities were left to the school communities (Manona 1992).

Secondly, Manona (1992) argues that the conflict over local government was not only ideological but also a conflict between those who did or did not have access to traditional local government structures. These groupings had identifiably different educational profiles. The Chiefs' councils had tended to be dominated by elderly, uneducated men. The more progressive Civics and Residents Associations, on the other hand, tended to be dominated by younger, more educated people with considerable participation by women, students and teachers.

Thirdly, schools were frequently centres for political organisation. Youth organisation intensified after the coup and young people took a leading role in the formation of the Residents' Associations.

Another difference between the Ciskei and other former bantustans relates to the level of participation of people in rural areas in political resistance. The 1990 protests started in more rural areas when residents of the Tyolomnqa villages started to return or burn their Ciskei National Independence Party membership cards as a symbol of rejection of Sebe's rule (NLC 1990). CDE officials interviewed for this research in 1993 believed that young people further away from the urban centres in the Ciskei are no less politicised than those in Mdantsane.

These dynamics may be partly explained in terms of the fact that the Ciskei as a whole is less 'rural' than other former bantustans. The Ciskei is fairly small with a high average population density (averaging over 99 persons per sq km, according to Southall, 1993). While only about 12% of the Ciskei population live in proclaimed townships, according to the DBSA, over 84% are functionally urbanised (DBSA 1989). Apart from its relatively urban political ethos, the Ciskei has a long history of political consciousness and student participation in political activities.

This political consciousness is reflected in the strength of SADTU organisation. A SADTU official interviewed for this research argued that a youth culture has developed in the Ciskei which bases respect on political involvement. This makes it all the more imperative that teachers have a strong political profile. He believed that SADTU was even stronger in rural areas than in urban areas. He argued that there is more political diversity and opportunities for political expression and participation in urban areas while in rural contexts the options were limited to education organisations and residents' associations; the latter tended to be teacher led.

SADTU has been well supported in the Ciskei. The organisation had been part of the broader stream of opposition to Gqozo's government which culminated in the Bisho massacre. Part of the Ciskei government's response to this resistance has been the suspension and transfer of many teachers (specially SADTU members). In some cases 3 or more teachers from one school and up to 30 teachers from one area had been transferred or suspended. SADTU was also in conflict with the CDE around the issue of the introduction of SRC constitutions

In 1993, the activities of Sadtu in the Ciskei focused on winning recognition from the Ciskei government. Sadtu organised across rather than within regional boundaries but it operated differently in its dealings with the RSA DET from the way it operated in its dealings with the CDE. According to officials interviewed for this research, SADTU found the Ciskei Education Department much more intransigent than the DET in the Eastern Cape.

The NECC appeared to have been less successful in winning popular support in the Ciskei and the Eastern Cape. In 1993 the NECC aimed to develop policy positions on specific education issues and to engage the state on these issues. This process was translated into a series of national and regional campaigns to debate policy and discuss the NEPI documents. The NECC called for the establishment of PTSA's but by 1993 this call had not received a strong response in the Ciskei. The organisation also co-operated with other organisations such as the Education Development Trust in King William's Town .

By 1993 the Eastern Cape - and specifically the Ciskei-East London area - had taken on board the strategy of forums and networks in education and other development related fields to a greater extent than any other region. The Border Kei Development Forum brought together state, progressive, NGO and business groupings. The Extended Executive Committee brought together service organisations and NGO's. Bi- or multi-lateral co-operative ventures involving progressive organisations, NGO's and businesses were more common than elsewhere. The NECC co-operated with a number of other NGO's including ITEC (to organise Winter Schools), SACHED (concerning governance), and the IDT (concerning use of resources). The NECC also worked with local business re funding, bursaries and Saturday Schools.

The Border Kei Development Forum - one of a series of similar regional forums - is a potentially important organisation. At the time of this research in 1993, it's objectives were expressed in terms of the establishment of a development strategy and an institutional structure to manage and give effect to social and economic development (BKDF Project Description 1992). It saw itself as operating throughout region D as it was defined by the RSA government (and potentially in a redefined region D including the whole Transkei) although its HO has greater proximity to the Ciskei. It was initiated by business interests and was funded by Mercedes Benz. It's member organisations included most of the major political groupings from the PAC to the Ciskei government.

According to the Human Resources officer at BKDF, the organisation was a 'mini Codesa'. It was concerned with co-ordination, networking and providing a forum for debate and not with provision. In the sphere of human resources it aimed to establish an Institute for the Development of Human Resources. Functions would include research, consultancy and facilitating a forum for debate. For the BKDF, 'human resources' includes formal education, technical training and adult education. The BKDF expected to focus on technical training and tertiary education. It had made an initial (abortive) attempt to set up a committee which would develop a regional education plan involving all six education departments which operate in the region.

IDASA is another well resourced NGO based in East London. Its plans also focus on providing a forum for regional education policy debate. Its current projects include 'leadership skills' workshops for students and crisis intervention.

In the months since this research was conducted, the experience in negotiating and networking within the education sector in the Ciskei-East London has proven useful in the process of incorporating the Ciskei and re-integrating the various Eastern Cape education departments. The Eastern Cape was the first region to establish a regional Education and Training Forum and produce research commissions to inform the integration process. (Regional Education and Training Primary Commission Report April 1994.)

#### **THE ROLE OF N.G.O'S**

Education NGO's have been important in the Eastern Cape in so far as they have supplemented state provision and carried forward a strategic planning process, through forums and networks, which the CDE and other education departments neglected.

There are a number of curriculum support projects active in the Ciskei. These include

- \* ITEC which also acts as an umbrella/host for READ and SEP
- \* Institute for the Study of English In Africa (ISEA) based at Rhodes which also acts as an umbrella/host for the Molteno project, a Shakespeare project, a maths project and an adult literacy project.
- \* A Geography project based at the CED Hlaziya INSET Centre
- \* A computer project
- \* ECDAFF based in Grahamstown is essentially a capacity building organisation for community based organisations but it also has a training branch and an education commission. Their aim is to present an alternative notion of

development to that of the state.

- \* The Fort Hare Adult Basic Education (ABEP) Project was started in 1992 as an International Extension College initiative (i.e. Lord Michael Young with IEC funds). Areas : Literacy and numeracy, life skills, job creation and vocational skills and capacity building
- \* The Border Service Organisations Forum
- \* UPE (SENSE) is developing community outreach programmes e.g. capacity building for civics.
- \* The Centre for Social Development (Thelma Henderson) at Rhodes provides funds for scholarship, pre-schools, creches and a secretarial skills school.
- \* The Early Learning Centres which has co-ordinated extensive provision of educare and provided training.
- \* The SACHED distance education project for adults
- \* There are a few smaller literacy projects at Duncan Village (Linungelo Lethu), in King William's Town (Zengisa) and in PE (Adult Learning Project)
- \* Some Industry based projects are extending their services beyond their own workers e.g. Mercedes Benz.

There is considerable more NGO activity in the Ciskei than most of the other former bantustans including neighbouring Transkei. The reason for a greater proliferation of N.G.O's in the Ciskei may have to do with the proximity of non-bantustan bases such as the corridor between Ciskei and Transkei, East London, Port Elizabeth, Grahamstown, Rhodes University and UPE. The following factors may have contributed to this:

- \* Bantustan governments were not always well disposed to the more progressive N.G.O's. These could not be as easily excluded from the Ciskei as from the larger bantustans since they could operate from outside the Ciskei borders.
- \* The easier geographic accessibility of a pool of infrastructural resources in 'white' areas to the Ciskei
- \* The more urbanised character of the East London-Ciskei-Port Elizabeth area would not only have produced more resources (including human resources), but also more demand. People are more likely to seek training if there is a possibility that it would lead to employment, for example.

Davies and Madlavu (1993) have shown how NGO's tend to cluster around metropolitan areas. In their study of community based development organisations (CBDO) in the Eastern Cape, Davies and Madlavu identified 67 CBDO's in the Eastern Cape (not including the Ciskei and the Transkei). According to this study almost 90% of the activities of those CBDO's that responded to a questionnaire occurred within a radius of 150 km from Port Elizabeth. A significant proportion of the NGO's in Davies and Madlavu's study were involved in educational work. Twelve percent of the programmes provided formal and non-formal education while another 20% related to training and skills development and career guidance.

## SECTION B: THE CISKEI DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

### The Bureaucracy

A recent report which appraises education planning and systems management makes the following comment:

There is an emerging capability for educational planning in the TBVC states. For example, Ciskei and Bophuthatswana have recently developed information systems which can provide institutionally specific data on all relevant planning factors (pupil information by standard and age, teacher information and classroom and learning materials availability). However, considerable staff development is needed before these systems can be fully used (Fehnel et al 1993 pg 35).

A visit to the CDE in early 1993 did not find any evidence of any such information system, or of other indications of managerial capacity, within the top layers of the Ciskei bureaucracy. The Director General did not know when the last Annual Report had been produced. (The most recent report which could be found in the CDE offices was the 1989 report, although a 1992 report has subsequently been produced.) It was not possible to interview Chief Directors within a number of sections within the CDE because the positions had become vacant over a period of years and new appointments had not been made. The Director responsible for planning did not know what specific planning data was available or where to find it. His assistant, who sat in an adjacent office surrounded by piles of overflowing folders was prepared to 'try to find' the right piece of paper in response to specific requests. The information on the 'pieces of paper' had been typed on a typewriter and there was no evidence of the use of a computer. Arithmetic calculations on columns of statistical information were inaccurate as often as they were accurate. Officials could refer to planning procedures which they had been introduced to by the DET but there was no evidence that these were actually implemented.

These problems cannot be explained merely in terms of resources or access to skills training. Indeed, the impression given was that top management within the CDE was chaotic compared to education departments in the Transkei and KaNgwane, which have fewer resources and a smaller pool of highly skilled and educated people to draw on. Instead, the problems seemed to come from the effects of political conditions within the upper echelons of the CDE. Top posts were insecure and were retained only through political compliance. Accountability was based on relationships of patronage between top officials and their superiors. There was considerable anecdotal evidence that Director Generals in various departments were expected to act as personal assistants to Ministers and to be on call to run personal errands. The Minister of Education had publically conflated his personal and political projects when he said that he would not meet with SADTU because he believed they had insulted him on a personal level.

There was little evidence that the CDE had developed formal educational policies and planning procedures of its own. Instead, it depended on inputs and guidelines from a number of agencies which have mediated South African education policies to the Ciskei and other former bantustans. These include KEOSSA (die Komitee vir Ontwikkeling en Samewerking in Suid Afrika) which is a committee of the Foreign Affairs Department, SECOSAF (the Secretariat for the Economic Community of South Africa), and a JFAC (Joint Financial Adjustment Committee) facilitated



by the DBSA to mediate between bantustans and the Foreign Affairs Department about finances. While communications between the DET and the CDE have been routed through these structures, the planning procedures of the CDE (for example for deciding where new classrooms should be built) were replica's of DET procedures. These procedures have not actually been implemented in the Ciskei. Instead, Ciskeian officials follow a masterplan which was drawn up by consultants commissioned by KEOSSA. Since funding was only released for plans approved by the DFA, there was little motivation for the CDE to deviate from approaches and priorities prescribed by South Africa.

There was some indication that the CDE had received specific technical procedures and information about whether specific areas of provision would be funded without being introduced to the overall policy rationale of official policy discourse in South Africa. This applied, for example to definitions of responsibility for provision of preschool educare and adult education. CDE officials still accepted the principle that the state is responsible for provision of educare and adult education, unlike DET officials who had elaborated a discourse which limits the responsibility of the state at these levels, as was evident in the De Klerk government's Education Renewal Strategy. CDE officials have been guided towards emulating the current practices of the DET by pressure to adopt a range of specific policies rather than by the internalisation of the underlying rationale of RSA/DET education policy trends. This process was facilitated by the passive (though not uncritical) attitude of officials who were very conscious of the dependence of their departments on RSA money.

Generally, the CDE officials interviewed for this report seemed to be more cowed than incompetent. They seemed unable or unwilling to provide a critical overview of work in their sections, to discuss broader education issues or simply to speak their minds. Perhaps the strongest image of the ethos of the CDE given in interviews with senior officials was not so much the picture of Gqozo which dominated each office but the way in which officials would gesture to the picture and shrug, helplessly.

## **STATISTICAL OVERVIEW OF THE CDE**

(1993 statistics are given unless otherwise indicated.)

**Enrolment in CDE Registered Pre-Primary Classes: 2 576 (1992)**

### **Schools:**

Primary	570
Secondary	197

### School Enrolment:

Primary Schools	183 800
Secondary Schools	88 100
Total	271 900

NOTE: This constitutes about 12% of the school enrolment for the new Eastern Cape Province.

### **Teachers:**

Primary Teachers	5 122
Secondary Teachers	2 934

\*Age: 58% over the age of 35

\*Qualifications:

36% at least M+3

55% underqualified

9% unqualified

\*Gender: 67% female of Ciskei school teachers are female.

In the top four (out of seven) post levels, women constitute 26% of staff.

### **PTR's:**

Primary	1:36
Secondary	1:30
Average	1:34

### **POST SECONDARY EDUCATION**

\*Students at Colleges of Education numbered 3141 of which

- 2080 were female

- 1460 were in their first year (911 primary; 549 secondary)

- 846 were in their second year

- 835 were in their final year

\*Fort Hare University Enrolment: 5750

\*Enrolment at Technikon : 487

\* refers to 1991 data

Sources:

- i) Statistical information provided by the CDE
- ii) Eastern Cape Regional Education and Training Primary Commission
- iii) DBSA Public Expenditure on Education in South Africa Vol 2. 1993
- iv) DBSA Education in the Eastern Cape April 1994.

**Students : Ciskei**

According to CDE statistics, enrolment figures for 1992 were

Pre-primary		2 576	
Junior Primary	Sub A - std 2	120 382	
Senior Primary	Std 3 - std 5	71 853	Total Primary
192 235			
Junior Secondary	Std 6 - 8	61 470	
Senior Secondary	Std 9 - 10	23 996	
Total Secondary		85 466	
Total School	277 701		

(Statistics provided by the CDE. Arithmetical errors have been corrected.)

The primary school enrolment has dropped every year since 1987 when it was 199 310. By 1993 there had been a further ten percent drop in primary school enrolment to 183 800. Sub A to standard three enrolments have been decreasing since 1984 (in the case of Sub A), 1985 (in the case of Sub B, standard one and standard two) and 1986 (in the case of standard three). Standard four and five enrolments have been stable or have decreased slightly since 1983. Enrolments throughout the secondary school have increased steadily, apart from a bulge for standards eight to ten in 1984 and 1985 (Based on DBSA 1993).

A document commissioned by KEOSSA and the Ciskei Government suggests that the decline in primary enrolment was initially due to political unrest and more recently due to the introduction of pre-school classes and the raising of the school entry age from 5 to 6 years. (Ciskei Government 1991). This explanation seems to suggest that children were drawn into the pre-school classes of the CDE and leaves out of account other developments in the mid-eighties which are likely to have influenced enrolment. In 1985 there was a major drought in the Ciskei. As part of its drought relief programme, the Ciskei Government established an employment programme for women, together with the Border Early Learning Centre and Operation Hunger. Women were employed to establish pre-schools. They were trained by BELC and paid by the Ciskei Government's Rural Development Programme division of the Agricultural Department. Operation Hunger provided food for the children at the pre-schools (Whisson 1992).

None of these factors explain why the biggest drop in Sub A intake was between 1983 and 1984, nor why enrolments have continued to drop every year since 1986. This question must be revisited within a broader study which considers enrolment in the Eastern Cape as a whole.

**DISTRIBUTION OF STUDENTS ACROSS THE SYSTEM**

The following table shows the distribution of students across all levels in 1992.

**Ciskei : Enrolment Figures for Each Year of Schooling - 1992**

	Total	Males	Females	%Repeaters
Sub A	39 394	21 393	18 001	17
Sub B	28 780	15 396	13 384	
Std 1	26 698	14 171	12 527	
Std 2	25 510	13 267	12 243	
Std 3	26 254	13 500	12 754	
Std 4	23 868	11 739	12 129	
Std 5	21 863	10 475	11 388	7,7
Std 6	22 704	10 588	12 116	
Std 7	19 840	8 778	11 062	20
Std 8	18 926	7 936	10 990	31
Std 9	12 314	5 245	7 069	
Std 10	11 682	4 614	7 068	30

Source: Internal CDE Documents

**Repeaters**

The overall percentage of primary school students who were repeaters in 1992 was 11% but there was considerable regional variation (In Zwelitsha South 15% of primary school students were repeaters while in Mdantsane South East the equivalent figure was 7%).

The average percentage of students who were repeaters in the secondary schools in 1992 was 25% with a regional variation from 20% (Middledrift) to 30% (Zwelitsha North).

**Progression**

In order to track the progression of students throughout the system, information about repeaters and drop outs over an extended period would be required. This was not available. The annual enrolment for the 1982 Sub A cohort is given below to show the net decrease from Sub A to standard 10.

**Cohort Enrolment 1982 to 1993**

	Sub A 1982	Sub B 1983	Std 1 1984	Std 2 1985	Std 3 1986	Std 4 1987	Std 5 1988
Male	23 621	14 402	14 988	12 848	12 459	10 874	9 877
Female	21 847	15 666	14 895	13 098	13 380	12 549	11 596
Total	45 468	30 068	29 893	25 945	25 839	23 423	21 473

	Std 6	Std 7	Std 8	Std 9	Std 10
	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993
Males	9 155	7 564	7 411	5 245	n/a
Females	11 605	10 058	10 149	7 069	n/a
Total	20 760	17 622	17 560	12 314	11 700

The table above suggests that some years are more problematic than others. The drop in enrolment after sub A represents an important and urgent problem. The increases in enrolment in standard one (boys), and standards three, six and eight (girls) indicate that there is a problem. There is not sufficient information to tell whether the drop in's have outnumbered the drop out's, repeater rates are very high or students are entering from a different department.

### **Ciskei: Sub A's**

The sub A group is substantially larger than the sub B group. This indicates a high failure and drop out rate. There were 40 535 sub A's in 1991. If this is compared to the figure for sub B's in 1992 minus the number of repeaters in sub B i.e. 25 125 it would appear that 15 410, or 38%, either failed or dropped out at the end of sub A in 1991. Of these, only 6 754 stayed on as repeaters; the remaining 8 656 (21%) left the system either temporarily or permanently.

According to CDE officials interviewed for this report, Ciskei Sub A teachers do not have access to the Ciskei in-service training centre and subject advisers did not work with them. Their only form of support come from the inspectors who are not generally very highly thought of. One interviewee indicated that the appointment of inspectors was often a reward for long service rather than a recognition of ability.

Research in other former bantustans suggest some other possible reasons for the high Sub A drop out rate. The most important of these is the fact that Sub A tends to be given the lowest priority when all kinds of resources are allocated. They are likely to get the least qualified teachers and the least comfortable classroom. It is likely that the same rationale would apply to the distribution of books, though there is no research to support this. Since the passing or failing of Sub A's generally depends on their ability to read, it is not surprising that many do not achieve this goal under these conditions. Teaching a large group of children to read requires a competent teacher and reading materials.

### **Ciskei: Enrolment and Gender**

It is clear from the departmental enrolment, repeater statistics that there are distinct gender patterns in the passage of students through schools. This was manifest in the 1992 statistics in the following ways:

- \* There were significantly more males than females in sub A (54% were male in 1992).
- \* The proportion of males decreased with each successive level. Thus up to

std 3 females constituted less than 50% of each year group. In std 4-6 females constituted 50-55% of each group and in std's 7-10 females constituted 56-61% of the total.

- \* While there were more male than female repeaters up to std 4, the number of female repeaters was greater in every subsequent year. This does not necessarily mean that more females failed but rather that more of those who failed and did not leave were females.
- \* The numbers of females dips more substantially than the number of males between std 8 and 9; it would appear that many females who manage to get as far as std 8 do not enter senior secondary school.

The cohort table, above, tells a similar story to the 1992 figures, indicating that the gender enrolment pattern has been well established over the last decade or more. Since 1976 there have been more males in the first four years of schooling and more females from standard three to standard eight. Prior to 1980 there were more males in standard ten. Although females in standard ten outnumber males, standard eight continues to be a point at which a large proportion of females drop out.

The larger number of male failures provides part of the explanation for the higher number of males at the junior primary level. The figures would suggest that more males than females are repeating and damming up in the early years and then dropping out after standard four. The reasons for dropping out are not only related to failure of examinations since many girls who fail stay on in the system.

Interviewees suggested that the drop out of boys could be explained in terms of the fragmentation of families as parents enter a migrant labour market and the traditional expectation that boys - specially eldest sons - take responsibility for the family when fathers are absent. While both males and females are expected to do domestic chores from an early age, boys' tasks are more likely to result in absenteeism and eventual dropping out.

Other explanations have emerged from work in other former bantustans. Most interestingly, it seems that males can afford to drop out more than females can, in the sense that literate males without a standard ten have a better chance of finding semi-skilled employment than females with a similar level of schooling (See report on Lebowa).

#### **CDE REGISTERED PRE-SCHOOLS**

The CDE subsidises 'about 23' pre-schools. A pre-primary teachers' training programme has been introduced although it is still embryonic. The CDE also subsidises over 200 child carers at educare centres. The department aims to employ one qualified pre-primary teacher for each educare centre.

The number of pupils in pre-schools registered with the CDE is low (2 576); the DBSA has estimated that there were 35 459 five year old children in the Ciskei in 1992 (DBSA 1993). Kromhout, an NGO worker who had previously represented the DFA in the Ciskei, believes that as many as half the children in the 3 - 6 year age group are in some form of child care in the Ciskei, mostly with NGO centres with educare workers trained by the Early Learning Centres. According to Kromhout, a large number of funders contribute to this

work in an unco-ordinated way.

The Ciskei government did not provide separate facilities for pre-primary schools although it has taken over the facilities of some of the pre-primary schools previously built by N.G.O's (See Whisson) 1992. The Ciskei master plan for facilities (discussed more fully below) does allow for the inclusion of pre-primary classrooms in some new schools though it does not indicate which.

#### **Adult Education in the CDE**

No statistics were available from the CDE concerning adult education. There is an Adult Education division in the CDE though very little information could be obtained about this. The programme is accommodated in schools. Mac Alistair and Manona's study of adult education opportunities in two areas in the Ciskei suggests that CDE adult education classes are not very highly regarded by potential learners.

An Adult Education project has recently been established at Fort Hare and this might provide useful information in future.

#### **Ciskei : Education Facilities Other than Schools**

The Ciskei has four education colleges, one Technikon and three (or four?) technical colleges.

The CDE has a teacher upgrading centre at Lovedale and a teachers' Inservice Centre at Mdantsane (Hlaziya)

#### **TEACHERS**

##### **Numbers**

Numbers of teachers have decreased in the Ciskei, in line with decreases in enrolments. The pupil teacher ratio's have come down considerably in recent years and are within acceptable limits.

	Primary	Secondary	Total	
1991				
Male	1 635	1 342	2 977	
Female	4 608	1 479	6 087	
Total	6 243	2 821	9 064	
TPR	1:43	1:46		
1992			7 955	
1993	5 122	2 943	8 056	TPR
1:36	1:30	1:34		

##### **Sources:**

- i) CDE internal documents (1992)
- ii) DBSA 1993 (1991)
- iii) DBSA 1994 (1993)

### TPR Variation 1992

While Pupil Teacher ratio's in the Ciskei compare favourably with other former bantustans such as the Ciskei, there is considerable regional variation as is shown in the following comparison of two sub-regions.

	Primary PTR	Secondary PTR
Alice	1:34	1:39
Zwelitsha North	1:49	1:48

Source: Internal CDE documents.

### Teacher Qualifications (1991)

The table below shows that only 9% of teachers were unqualified in 1991. If Standard ten plus three years of training (including a professional qualification) is considered to be a minimum acceptable level of qualification, 55% may still be considered to be unqualified.

	Number	%
Qualified	3 236	35
Underqualified	4 991	55
Unqualified	837	9

### Teachers: Gender Issues

In 1991, 67% of all Ciskei teachers were women. Their qualification levels were significantly different from those of the male teachers. More male teachers were qualified, while more female teachers were under- or unqualified, as is shown in the following table.

	% Qualified	% Underqualified	% Unqualified
Men	46	44	8
Women	30	60	10

Source DBSA 1993

Men also predominated in the more senior post levels while women predominated at lower post levels.

Post level	% Men	% Women
1	29	71
2	25	75
3	50	50
4	73	27
5	72	28
6	87	13
7	100	0



Source: Based on DBSA 1993

The predominance of males in the more senior posts is also reflected in the gender distribution across salary notches. While 30% of salaries of male teachers were pitched above the middle notch, only 11% of salaries of female teachers were pitched above the middle notch.

### **Teachers of Scarce Subjects**

The CDE has been found it particularly difficult to supply sufficient teachers for the 'scarce subjects' i.e. maths, physical science and biology. In order to fill the gap they have employed substantial numbers of expatriates from countries such as Ghana, India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka.

### **Teachers in Urban and Rural Schools**

The distribution of teachers contributes to rural-urban differentiation of education in terms of both access and quality. In the bantustans, as elsewhere, teachers tend to prefer to teach in urban areas, particularly in proclaimed townships which have better infrastructure. There are a number of reasons for this, some of which are more obvious than others. Teachers themselves wish to be near the resources and comforts which urban areas offer. Perhaps more important is the fact that employment practices assume an urban context and no allowance is made for the ways in which rural contexts do not conform to this context. Teachers can, for example, utilise housing subsidies in urban areas while in rural areas they cannot do so. Instead of buying their own houses where they could live with their families, teachers in rural areas often have to board with other families. Understandably, this discourages teachers from accepting posts in these areas if they have any choice. (Though, according to Palmer, women were not able to utilise housing subsidies in townships such as Zwelitsha and Mdantsane as recently as 1990 in terms of a government proclamation which he refers to only as 'R293') (Palmer 1992)

In the competition for the more desirable jobs in urban schools, the teacher with the least attractive curriculum vitae is often relegated to the more far flung schools. Under these circumstances teachers often regard posts at rural schools as a temporary fill in until they can get a post in town. Given these conditions and the fact that teacher training is generally geared to urban school (i.e. schools with electricity, running water and a separate classroom for each standard), it is not surprising that rural schools are stigmatised as places of employment.

The stigmatisation of rural schools has curriculum implications at the senior secondary level where there is some subject choice. Since there are fewer teachers of maths and science than are needed and these are regarded as important subjects, these teachers tend to find posts in urban areas.

Another category of sought after teachers are teachers with professional qualifications and degrees and it is likely that these would also tend to

move into urban schools. It is known that many rural schools employ private, unqualified teachers although official figures do not reflect the extent of this practice.

It is fairly common for teachers who are assigned to schools outside the proclaimed townships to maintain a base in town and commute to the school on a daily or weekly basis. There are cases, for example, of schools at which the whole staff commute together in a reserved taxi. This means that the functioning of the school is subject to the times at which taxis run and the passibility of roads.

## **FACILITIES**

### **The Financing of School Buildings**

From the point of view of CDE officials interviewed for this research, there is no official policy for the creation of a system of state schools in urban areas and community schools in rural areas. They explain the different ways of financing facilities as the result, rather, of the unplanned but unavoidable outcome of attempts to respond to variable needs and demands with extremely limited finances and of the different conditions in rural and urban areas. They do not see the community school mode of financing facilities as part of a system but rather as a response to the financial inability of the system to reach all communities.

Although the R1 for R1 system was a systematically organised mode of provision in the Ciskei in the past, departmental bureaucrats currently see community payment for school facilities as an unacceptable mode of provision.

### **Planning Procedures for school building**

The CDE planning procedures for school building programmes are similar (on paper) to those of the DET. This system has only been introduced in the last few years. (In previous years the Ciskei used a quota per directorate system). In theory, the new approach allocates new schools and classrooms purely on the basis of need. The locations for new schools are identified by the education departments, mainly on the basis of pupil: classroom ratio's in existing schools. There are still significant differences between the approach of the CDE and that of the DET:

\* The CDE has been subject to mediation of funding and planning by the RSA Department of foreign affairs and KEOSSA

\* The Departments of Public Works is still involved in the building of schools in the Ciskei unlike the DET which has it's own building section and does not have to work through another department.

Recent corruption reports such as that relating to the Dept of Works in the Transkei suggest that this the involvement of more than one department may have introduced additional complications in school building procedures. The involvement of the Department of Public Works has also meant that there is a strong separation between school building and school maintenance functions.

## **Ciskei: Planning Procedures for Schools Building**

Prior to 1985 school building in the Ciskei was funded from the Ciskei's own budget; 12 schools were built with funds from the SADT. In 1985 a phased school building programme was introduced, funded by KEOSSA with a contribution from the Ciskei. The upgrading of schools is still funded from the Ciskei's budget and is not part of the KEOSSA programme; the KEOSSA programme does include facilities such as offices, staffrooms, toilets and the levelling of fields at new schools as well as furniture for new buildings. KEOSSA is centrally involved in the implementation of the programme along with other advisors from 'various RSA Government departments'. In the first three phases of the current programme (1985 to 1991) 118 schools comprising 611 classrooms were built at a cost of R23 million.

In 1993, when the fieldwork for this research was done, the CDE had reached phase four of the school building programme. The guidelines for phase four were drawn up in 1991 by the CDE and the Ciskei Department of Public Works in consultation with a private consultancy (Van Wyk & Louw Partnership) for the RSA Dept of Foreign Affairs. This was part of a larger education development strategy which in turn was part of a Ciskei National Development Plan. The phase four school building programme is a three year plan; it constitutes the first of a three stage programme to eliminate the classroom backlog in the Ciskei by the year 2000.

The Phase Four schools project description document estimated the 1991 backlog to be 2200 classrooms, which is considerably higher than the RSA DET estimate for the Ciskei, based on global estimating techniques, which set the backlog at 903 classrooms. In this first three year phase the plan proposed that 706 classrooms be built. According to the Director of Planning services, the average cost of a classroom was R40 000 in 1993.

The difference between the estimates of backlogs made by the RSA based on global estimates and those reflected in the Phase Four plan based on school by school calculations is significant. Much of the macro planning for education is based on global estimating techniques even though officials concerned with planning know that national averages for pupil:classroom and pupil:teacher ratio's are much lower than median ratio's of actual class sizes.

A senior DET planning official has said in an interview that the actual ratio's in classrooms were frequently up to double the national average (Quoted in Jacklin 1991).

The Phase Four document estimates that the 1991 Ciskei CPR was 55:1, if temporary or unacceptable structures are excluded. This is considerably higher than global estimates of the DBSA, and the CDE which do not take classroom quality into account. In 1989 the DBSA estimated the Ciskei CPR as around 46:1 while the CDE statistics for 1992 give the primary school CPR as 43:1 and the secondary school CPR as 46:1. The Phased programme aims at a ratio of 40:1 (primary) and 35:1 (secondary) by the year 2 000.

None of these averages reflect the range of CPR's in actual classrooms. The Phase Four list of primary schools targeted for extensions included schools

at which the CPR's ranged from 75:1 to 482:1.

This multiplicity of ratio's suggests that

- National or large regional averages are misleading unless they are based on actual class sizes rather than total enrolments. Medians would be more meaningful than averages. - CPR statistics should be disaggregated in terms of significant categories. It would be useful to distinguish between averages inside and outside proclaimed townships, and between community and state funded facilities.
- CPR's are only meaningful when the term classroom is defined

### **Ciskei: Parent Involvement in School Building**

The Phase Four programme envisaged various forms of parent participation but these would only come into effect after a particular school building project had been identified. In the document, community participation is seen as a means to legitimate the school, for example by making the building of the school conditional on the acceptance of the local community. It also envisaged that the school building industry could become an economic development programme which would bring jobs and skills to members of the local community.

### **Marginalising Rural: Discourses and Plans**

The Phase Four document asserts that, although schools are to be built strictly according to need, the need is greater in the urban centres (presumably Mdantsane and King William's Town/Bisho). Paul Kromhout, who devised the first phase of the Ciskei School Building Programme when he was with the Co-operation and Development Section of the RSA Foreign Affairs Dept in 1985/6, said in an interview for this research that it was understood even then that the 'greater need' was in urban areas.

The Phase Four document does not address the fact that most schools in rural areas have been built by parents and that this system has invariably resulted in cheaper, less hardy and sophisticated structures than those built by the government in the townships. The shortage of classroom space in areas outside proclaimed towns and townships is not acknowledged. There is no mention in the document of the way in which land is allocated for schools. This is not a problem in urban areas where township plans allocate sites for schools but in rural areas the process is more complicated. According to official CDE policy in 1993, the CDE could still not become involved until a community had applied for a site through the local authority (headman or residents association) to the Department of Internal Affairs.

It would appear that, while there is officially no distinction between urban and rural areas when it comes to prioritising locations for new schools, in practice most if not all of these are to be built in the more urban areas.

Within the CDE, the prevalence of a technicist discourse of equality of provision based on objective measures rather than values sits uncomfortably alongside obvious differences in levels of actual provision. Officials cope

with this incongruity by asserting that areas where provision is inadequate lie beyond the financial reach of the system; unequal provision is not part of the system but rather indicates the failure of the system. The implication is that the system would operate equitably if there was more money. It is not generally acknowledged that the money that is available is not distributed equitably.

It seems that the old systematic community school system, in terms of which the state contributes a portion towards the cost of facilities provided by parents (i.e. versions of the old R1 for R1 system), fell away in the mid 80's on the assumption that state provision would be extended to all communities. When finances did not support this, rural communities were left with neither the partial support of the old community school system nor the promised state provision.

### **Qualitative differences**

The idea that the standards for school buildings must be partly determined by the socio-economic level and the political clout of the local community and that differentiated standards of provision are acceptable was implicit - and sometimes explicit - in the Phase Four document and the views of the CDE Director of Planning Services interviewed for this research. The Phase four document states that schools should be 'in line with the socio-economic environment' and that one selected senior secondary school in each directorate should be upgraded to 'a standard comparable with schools in the RSA'. In addition, 'a senior secondary school of a slightly higher standard was required in Bisho'.

The comments of the Director of Planning Services reflected a similar theme. He indicated that rural communities were not 'enlightened' enough to be able to benefit from facilities such as sports fields. He mentioned that a more user friendly school plan was available but that this would only be used in urban areas where communities had the resources - such as piped water - to maintain the school. In his view, this type of school design also 'psychologically discouraged' unruly behaviour such as boycotts. These comments provided an unusually transparent account of the ways in which urban communities benefitted from the threat of political pressure and a discourse which assumes that the standard of social services should be adjusted to the socio-economic level of the surrounding area.

The legitimization of spatial inequalities in the provision of facilities by the CDE is reminiscent of an approach which emerged in the DET around 1990, in terms of both procedures and values. This approach affirms differentiated standards of provision within expanded access and foreground the notion of 'appropriacy' rather than comparable quality of provision.

### **NGO's, Parent Communities and School Building**

From an official perspective, NGO or community **funding** of school building is almost invisible in the Ciskei since, officially, schools are built by the government. It is official policy that communities may contribute their skills and labour to the building of state schools in that they would be

employed by contractors. It is also policy to draw in communities at the planning stage so that they would have a sense of ownership and responsibility for schools. These schools would be built according to departmental plans and standards.

In practice rural communities find their own sources of funding including various N.G.O's such as the Small Projects Development Trust or the IDT. There is currently no co-ordination of these funding activities and it is difficult to know what their combined contribution has been. The Director of Planning Services thought that the IDT had built 'four or five' schools so far. It seems that the IDT has not been readily accepted, politically, and that their programme is not well established as yet. They do not have formal relations with the CDE while NECC co-operation with them is fraught with ideological differences and suspicions.

According to Paul Kromhout, the idea that parents should be involved in school building has been around since the mid 80's when he devised phase one of the school building programme. Parents were to contribute labour (not money) to the building of state schools in both rural and urban areas. The question was whether individual parents or communities should be paid for this and, if so, how. (Interview for this research)

In an interview with members of a SADTU committee in Middledrift, teachers said that in practice communities still built most of the classrooms in rural areas. The communities would collect the money, buy the material and either build the classrooms themselves or employ builders. Collected money was usually controlled by a committee of villagers or by the school principal.

#### **Strategies for coping with inadequate space.**

Every year ad hoc arrangements are made to supplement existing classroom space. These include the borrowing of classrooms by high schools and platooning. In 1985 platooning was introduced in lower primary schools in Mdantsane to create space for junior secondary schools

#### **CONCLUDING COMMENTS**

While the Ciskei has been richer in resources and development opportunities than other former bantustans, its external and internal political relations prevented it from taking advantage of these circumstances. The department was administratively weak and unable to engage constructively with progressive organisations. CDE policies were not developed internally but were derived from the DET via the mediating agencies of the DFA and the DBSA. These included policies which effectively legitimated spatial inequalities in the provision of schooling, and particularly of facilities.

## References

- Ackron J in Indicator Vol 11 No 1 1993
- Border-Kei Development Forum : Border Kei Development Plan Project Description. BKDF. 1992.
- Davies B and Madlavu M : Community-Based Development Organisations in the Eastern Cape: Towards Survival and Sustainability. Rhodes ISER 1993.
- DBSA : Public Expenditure on Education in South Africa Vol 2. 1993
- DBSA : Education in the Eastern Cape. 1994.
- De Wet C, C Manona and R Palmer : Local Responses to Political Policies and Socio-Economic Change in the Keiskammahoek District, Ciskei. ISER Rhodes University. 1992.
- De Wet C; S Coughlan, D Deliwe, J Segar, F Sperber, M Sully and A Westaway : From Reserve to Region - Apartheid and Change in the Keiskammahoek District of the Ciskei, 1950 to 1990. HSRC 1993.
- Davies B : Empowering the Poor in Indicator Vol 11 No 1 1993.
- Donaldson A : Untangling the Strings of the Puppets in New Ground 1993
- Eastern Cape Regional Education and Training Forum: Primary Commission 1994.
- Fehnel R; R Bergman, P Buckland, J Jansen, M Metcalf and Z Senkhane : Education Planning and Systems Management. A Consultancy Report. 1993
- Fox R: Regional Proposals: Their Constitutional and Geographical Significance. Forthcoming.1993
- Fox R : The Impact of Space: Land Division and Urban Development in Kenya and South Africa in International Regional Science Review Vol 15 No 1 1992
- Government of Ciskei : Ciskei Phase Four Schools Project. Oct 1991
- Keeton C : Two Lands, One Sky in Indicator October 1992.
- McAllister P and C Manona : Report on Survey of the Educational Needs of Adults in the Ciskei. ISER 1992.
- Segar J : The Pursuit of Health in a Ciskeian Village in De Wet et al 1993 op cit
- Southall H : Development and Prospects in Region D in Sash, Jan 1993.
- Southall R : Beyond the Bodycount in Reality Jan 1993.
- Whisson MG : Some Fell On Good Ground. ISER. Rhodes University 1992.