

SCHOOLING IN KWANDEBELE

BY

HEATHER JACKLIN

1994

FOREWORD

In 1994 educationist Heather Jacklin and sociologist Johann Graaff, both from the University of Cape Town, completed reports on rural education in each of the ten the homelands, and then a summary report – eleven reports in all. The overarching title of the set of reports was to have been *Rural education in South Africa: a report on schooling in the Bantustans*. Unfortunately the reports were never published, although photocopies did find their way to some researchers.

The titles and authors of the eleven reports are:

- Final report on homeland education (Jacklin and Graaff)
- Is Bop better? A case-study in educational innovation (Graaff)
- Schooling in KaNgwane (Jacklin)
- Inherit the wind: a report on education in Lebowa (Jacklin)
- Education as an instrument of war: the case of KwaZulu/Natal (Graaff)
- Schooling in KwaNdebele (Jacklin)
- Schooling in the Ciskei (Jacklin)
- Teachers without classrooms: education in Venda (Graaff)
- Klein maar getrain: education in QwaQwa (Graaff)
- Schooling in Gazankulu (Jacklin)
- Rural Education Project report: Transkei (Jacklin)

Linda Chisholm of the University of Johannesburg was one of the researchers who obtained a ring-bound photocopy of the eleven reports, and she has used them in her own research. She deemed them valuable enough to warrant digitizing, and in 2017 made the suggestion to me by way of her sister Alison (my deputy). Indeed, nothing as comprehensive as these reports had been published on education in the homelands. Further, though unpublished, a number of these reports have been cited.

In 2018 I was given the go-ahead to place them on the Wits institutional repository. Both Heather Jacklin and Johann Graaff readily gave Wits permission to do so. Heather also kindly provided MS Word copies of the present report, KwaNdebele, and of Ciskei, which we could turn into PDFs.

Mark Sandham
Education Librarian
University of the Witwatersrand
August 2018.

SCHOOLING IN KWANDEBELE

SECTION ONE

FIRST IMPRESSIONS: REFLECTIONS ON SPATIAL MEANINGS IN KWANDEBELE

In KwaNdebele, I discovered, you can tell the time by looking at the traffic on the roads. Before seven in the morning, a stream of buses full of commuters rumbles towards Pretoria. A few come the other way, occupied mainly by teachers who travel daily from Mamelodi and other townships to Kwandebele's schools. By seven o'clock, there are more taxis than buses. There are very few cars, and these are mainly government owned vehicles. I remember reading that there were only two cars registered for every eighty people in KwaNdebele in 1989, one of which was a commercial vehicle (DBSA 1992). As eight o'clock approaches, streams of students in variations of the standard black and white uniform filter through the houses and thicken in the dusty side streets before they flow through the gates of schools. Hardly a pedestrian can be seen that is not a student.

There are no real towns in Kwandebele, except for Ekangala near Bronkhorstspuit. A few other areas such as KwaMhlanga, Siyabuswa and Vaalbank are proclaimed townships but these consist mainly of government service buildings and harbour little economic activity. Amongst the visible businesses, liquor stores, garages, driving schools and panelbeaters seem to predominate, suggesting a need to maintain physical transport and psychological escape. Occasional clusters of dilapidated industrial sites are distributed, seemingly at random between the dense settlements, unintegrated into any visible town.

Since Kwandebele is an economic adjunct of Pretoria and the East Rand, roads are important and the dense settlements which spread out across the region are drawn up against the few major through routes between Pretoria, Marble Hall, Groblersdal and Bronkhorstspuit. The settlements to the North and East have stabilised; here most homes are built of concrete bricks or mud and daub with a fair smattering of brick buildings. In the South West, closer to Pretoria, Johannesburg and the East Rand, new settlements still mushroom up from the veld every couple of months and the proportion of corrugated iron shanties is much larger. The newer settlements are still swallowed up by the darkness at dusk. On windless mornings they remain invisible, shrouded in smoke, until long after dawn.

Not only the demographic and economic relations but also the turbulent political history of Kwandebele is inscribed on the landscape. Every so often the burnt out shells of businesses can be seen, reminding passersby of the turmoil that followed attempts to incorporate Moutse and to declare Kwandebele independent between 1984 and 1986. Residents still refer to the road from Siyabuswa to Moutse, along which Moutse residents were carried to torture in Siyabuswa, as 'the notorious Moloto road'. Siyabuswa itself,

stronghold of the faction that held power in the mid eighties, has lost its status as capital to the newer KwaMhlanga, closer to Pretoria. The old government buildings in Siyabuswa are reminiscent of a large school, but KwaMhlanga sports the assets characteristic of bantustan governments - the lager of large ornate government buildings, a stadium and at least one double story school with electricity and running water. There are two major traditional authorities - Ingwenyamas, or kings - in KwaNdebele: residents claim that resources have been more liberally distributed in the domains of the ruling Ndzundzas than in the domains of the Manala's during the last five or six years.

There were a number of crises in KwaNdebele during the week of my visit, but then I have yet to visit a (former) bantustan region where there are no current crises. That week's crop in KwaNdebele included conflict between taxi drivers and police, the drying up of the water supply due to broken pipes and a strike of government workers in response to the water shortage as well as to the breakdown of the delivery of medicines to clinics. Inside the government buildings, officials responded with little more than a shrug when these crises were mentioned. They were a familiar part of the daily routine. Talk of current political developments evoked a more animated response, particularly the possibility that KwaNdebele might be cut into two by the new provincial boundary between the PWV province and the Eastern Transvaal province. The map will be redrawn and the (social) meanings of (social) space will be redefined in this region. The officials realise that this will bring major changes for them and all the people who live here. They debate whether it would be more advantageous to be included in the richer PWV province or in the smaller Eastern Transvaal where they could have more impact on policies. A local ANC representative suggests that the traditional authorities would have more to gain from being part of the Eastern Transvaal while those who support civics and the ANC would prefer to be part of the PWV.

The purpose of my visit - and of this report - was to track some of the implications of these changing meanings - social, political, economic and spatial - at the level of schooling.

SECTION TWO THE CONTEXT OF SCHOOLING IN KWANDEBELE

KwaNdebele's recent history manifests the most bizarre and dramatic elements of South Africa's bantustan experience. The more sensational portions of this history have been recorded in detail, with attention to particular incidents and individuals (See for example McCaul 1987, Goldberg 1989, TRAC- Pienaar 1991 and Ritchken 199-). This retelling of the story sketches only the broadest outlines in order to contextualise the discussion of the schooling in the region.

Ritchken (199-) traces the formation of KwaNdebele and subsequent conflicts in the region back to the decimation and loss of land of the two Ndebele chiefdoms in the nineteenth century. The dream of regaining tribal land was kept alive until the sixties by traditional practices and structures. Such practices and structures were reinforced by farmers on whose land many of the Ndebele lived and who blocked the access of farm workers to non-traditional political and social practices, to urban areas and to education (Ritchken 199-). One of the consequences of this history is the relative strength of traditional practices and support for traditional authorities which is surprising so close to the PWV metropolis.

With the formation of the bantustans, branches of the Ndebele accepted land in both Lebowa and Bophuthatswana while others remained outside of these borders on white owned farms, mission stations and on land that had been purchased by Ndebele chiefs in the 1920's.

In 1969 there were discussions between Ndebele chiefs about the creation of an Ndebele bantustan. In 1974 Kwandebele was designated a regional authority with Simon Skosana - who was not a chief - as chairperson. In 1979 the Legislative Assembly was inaugurated with Skosana as Chief Minister. Responsibility for education in the region was shifted to the Kwandebele government. In 1984 the first elections were held for the sixteen elected members of the Legislative Authority; the remaining 72 members were nominated. Only males could vote. By this time Skosana's relations with the traditional authorities, particularly the royal household of the Ndzundza's, were strained. Skosana and his ruling clique successfully sidelined the traditional authorities into a separate government structure in 1983. Real power was held by cabinet ministers who were predominantly businessmen without traditional authority status (Ritchken).

Between 1975 and 1984 the KwaNdebele population grew from around 50 000 to over 260 000. Of these, more than half the newcomers came from white farming areas and just under a third came from Bophuthatswana (Ritchken 19-). By 1985 KwaNdebele was predominantly urban in terms of population density, with 86% of the population living in urban, semi-urban and peri-urban settlements although only about 13% lived in proclaimed towns . KwaNdebele had effectively become a dormitory township for East Rand workers, and fewer than two percent of residents derived any income from agriculture (Graaff 1987). The high rate of population increase continued throughout the second decade of KwaNdebele's existence. By 1991 the Census figures show a

population of just under 404 000 (Census 1991). This makes the population density in KwaNdebele higher than in any other former bantustan excepting QwaQwa even though only about 17% were living in proclaimed townships (Census 1991 and DBSA 1992). **(check Ciskei)**

Very little land - about 51 00 hectares - was available initially and the South African government cast around for portions of Lebowa and Bophuthatswana as well as white owned farms to patch together a more substantial territory (Murray 1986). This process of consolidation played itself out through the political relationships that pertained in each area. The Bophuthatswana government saw the creation of Kwandebele as an opportunity to push out Ndebele speaking residents from the Winterveld while Ndebele speakers in Bophuthatswana thought they might get a better deal in an Ndebele territory than they had done in Bophuthatswana. In the case of the Moutse territory, which had formerly been part of Lebowa, there was great resistance from most residents to incorporation into Kwandebele. Conflict around this issue led to violence at the end of 1985.

A second source of conflict in 1985 and 1986 was the issue of independence. The two issues were not unrelated: Helen Suzman accused the government of offering Moutse as a reward to the Kwandebele government for deciding to accept independence (McCaul 1987). Initially Skosana claimed to be opposed to the idea of independence but in 1982 he announced that Kwandebele would opt for independence. Initially the reaction from residents to the announcement was not strong but by 1986, in the context of other developments such as the actions of the Mbokotho vigilante group, resistance to independence was vehement. The Mbokotho operated under orders from Skosana and his right hand man, Ntuli, and represented the interests of an alliance of politicians and business owners. It not only targeted those who opposed plans for incorporation of Moutse and the independence of Kwandebele but also any youth who appeared not to conform to traditional discipline. In 1986 these conflicts erupted in a conflagration which has been called 'the war of the children'.

Haysom (1986) has discussed the rise of the Mbokotho as one of many vigilante groups which emerged in different parts of the country more or less simultaneously, suggesting that the promotion of such groups was part of a broader strategy of the South African government to undermine resistance movements. In the case of Kwandebele, however, opposition to the Mbokotho ultimately consolidated resistance to the governments bantustan policies. The incorporation of Moutse and independence were ultimately successfully resisted and the Mbokotho were disbanded. The 1984 elections were declared null and void following a legal charge brought by some of the women who had not been allowed to vote. In 1988 a new election indicated overwhelming support for candidates who had opposed independence. Following this election, the Ndzundza's entered key positions in the Kwandebele government. Prince James, who had led resistance to Skosana and Ntuli's independence project, became minister of education in 1988 and later became Chief Minister.

The 1988 elections introduced a period of relative political stability in KwaNdebele, but

the struggle against poverty continued. According to Cross et al 83% of those who lived outside the proclaimed townships in KwaNdebele were living below the minimum living level in 1989. KwaNdebele has a particularly poor profile in terms of social services; it has, for example, the lowest proportion of nurses, doctors and hospital beds in relation to its population of all the former bantustans (DBSA 1992). This situation is somewhat alleviated by the proximity of a metropolitan social infrastructure, but a hundred kilometres is a long way when private transport is unavailable and public transport is expensive and inconvenient. These struggles have been expressed in intermittent mass action against inadequacies in social service provision including issues related to education, sanitation, health and transport (Jarvis 1990).

THE IMPACT OF POLITICAL DEVELOPMENTS ON SCHOOLING

Access to schooling, on the one hand, and schools as a site of political organisation, on the other, have been an important element in political developments throughout KwaNdebele's history. For people living on white owned farms as well as people in Bophuthatswana, access to schools was an important motivation for supporting the formation of a new homeland and for moving into the region.

In the case of Ndebele speaking people in Bophuthatswana, harassment by the Mangope government had included a refusal to allow Ndebele as a medium of instruction in schools and a threat to discontinue Ndebele speaking teachers' salaries (Murray 1986). Mangope had also withdrawn subsidies for Ndebele schools in 1976 saying that these would only be reinstated if the Ndebele undertook to support Bophuthatswana government policies and accept Bophuthatswana citizenship. McCaul argues that, since it was difficult for the Ndebele to fulfil the conditions for citizenship, this was in fact an attempt to push the Ndebele out of Bophuthatswana and to lay claim to their land (McCaul 1987).

Those who had been living on white owned farms had been similarly handicapped by the lack of schooling available to the children of farmworkers. Families were drawn to Kwandebele by promises of access to schooling as much as by other advantages.

Even today, many parents establish homes in this region as a place where their children can live and attend school while the parents commute to the Reef on a daily or weekly basis. Teachers interviewed for this research believed that large numbers of school students live without adult supervision for days or weeks at a stretch (Interviews). These social conditions are reflected in the fact that KwaNdebele has a higher proportion of its population in the schools than any other region. According to DBSA calculations, over 37% of the total KwaNdebele were enrolled at schools in 1991 compared to 32% for all the SGT's and 27% for South Africa as a whole (DBSA 1993b).

Schools were not only seen as resources which offered opportunities but also as physical and social sites of organisation. Mbokotho targeted students as potential 'comrades' before students themselves were mobilised, and students did then take the lead in the

battle against Mbokotho, against independence and against the incorporation of Moutse. Van Niekerk describes the events of mid 1986 as a 'war involving armies of children' (in Goldblatt et al 1989). School boycotts were an effective resistance strategy supported by parents and teachers as much as by students. Teachers in Moutse expressed their resistance to incorporation when they refused to sign documents which declared them to be employees of the KwaNdebele government (McCaul 1987).

The centrality of both these themes - schools as resources and as sites of resistance - in the consciousness of people in KwaNdebele was reflected in Skosana's speech at the launch of the Mbokotho in January 1986:

We started this homeland with only R16,40 in our coffers and only 240 Ndebele people, with one school to our credit. We are now able to count our money in millions. I cycled all over getting our people together. Now that we have built expensive schools people want to burn them. Mbokotho will deal with such people (Quoted in McCaul 1987 pg 77).

The education system also provided an arena in which the political and economic dynamics of government were played out. The illegitimacy, unaccountability, corruption and incompetence of Skosana's government undermined the provision of education in KwaNdebele. The lack of competence of Skosana's government is illustrated by a decision, in 1982, to spend more than half the budget for social services (including education) on an impulsive purchase of construction equipment (TRAC 19-). Skosana's government was perhaps more overt than any of the other former bantustan government in using political power to bring private profit into the pockets of politicians, as is recorded in the Fifth Report of the Commission of Investigation into Maladministration in KwaNdebele set up to investigate corruption and maladministration in KwaNdebele (RSA 1993). Officials at all levels in the Department of Education are accused of having no respect for budgeting procedures and financial controls. Contracts for the provision of books, stationery and classroom building were manipulated to profit companies in which cabinet ministers had interests, at great cost to the education system.

While the Commission's Report is revealing concerning corruption and maladministration within the KwaNdebele government and specifically the Education Department, it must be seen not only as a record of events but also as a political tool in its own right. The Commission makes a point of suggesting that members of the Ndzundza royal house who were in the Legislative Assembly and in the bureaucracy after 1988 were as guilty as Skosana's government had been of corrupt practices. According to the report, maladministration was still rampant in the Department of Education in 1990 when investigations for the report were concluded. These accusations may well be valid, but it is also clear that the South African government chose to use the corruption report to cast blame onto the Ndzundza's whose political ambitions and resentment at being sidelined in government, it is suggested, were the main cause of the upheavals in KwaNdebele in the mid eighties. The South African Government of the day commissioned a series of corruption reports in a number of former bantustans, and those which emerged after 1991 consistently suggest that administration in the former bantustans should be brought

back under the control of the central government. It would seem that the purpose of these moves was to justify taking control of the bantustan administrations prior to the 1994 elections.

Prior to 1988, the insecurity of Skosana's government resulted in the exclusion of non-government education resources from KwaNdebele. The suspicion of the KwaNdebele government towards anti-independence groupings was extended to any individuals or organisations who might be bringing urban anti-apartheid influences into the region, including NGO's. The KwaNdebele government insisted that visitors to KwaNdebele required permits and these were seldom given to NGO personnel. Consequently educational NGO's such as literacy organisations and even humanitarian organisations such as Operation Hunger were discouraged from working in the area (TRAC 19-). Even today there are remarkably few such organisations active in KwaNdebele, in spite of the proximity of Johannesburg and Pretoria where many education support NGO's are based. There are a few exceptions such as the Science Education Project (Interviews with KDEC officials).

In KwaNdebele, in the eighties, political turmoil and broader social transitions such as urbanisation undermined the stability of social relations in ways which have impacted on schooling. There were shifts and tensions within and between hierarchies of authority based on political structures (traditional, governmental and civic authorities), ideological position (pro or anti bantustan independence), class (business owners or commuting workers), generation, educational status, gender, and cultural practices (urban or rural). Across all these categories residents of Kwandebele grouped themselves according to whether they perceived independence and submission to Skosana's government to be in their interests or not. Ritchken and others provide useful accounts of the ways in which some of these categories of residents saw their interests and the dynamics of the alliances that were formed during this period, for example between women, youth, civil servants (including teachers) and the Ndzundza traditional authorities on the one hand and business owners, the Manala royal family and the Kwandebele government, on the other.

The position of the traditional authorities, particularly the Ndzundza's, within these alliances evolved differently in KwaNdebele from other regions such as the Ciskei. In Kwandebele, the Ndzundza's were in political conflict with the ruling clique. Prince James of the Ndzundza royal family had a university degree while only one member of Skosana's cabinet had completed secondary schooling (Goldblatt et al 1989). The Ndzundza royal family adopted an anti apartheid, anti independence stance. They were receptive to shifts in traditional gender relations towards a more public role for women in civic matters (Ritchken). All of these factors created the ideological conditions for an alliance between the students and the Ndzundza's. The ultimate success of this alliance in achieving its political objectives both confirmed and redefined the political role of the Ndzundza's, as traditional authorities, in the region.

While shifting status and authority relations were expressed in alignments, these were uneven and temporary rather than fixed groupings. Authority and status hierarchies

continue to be unstable. Within this context, the status of teachers remains particularly ambivalent. Teachers tend to be urban based, often commuting to work in rural areas on a daily basis. (At a school in central KwaNdebele visited for this research, 75% of teachers were daily commuters). They tend to have higher education qualifications than do parents. Many have assimilated urban cultural practices and may not choose to be circumcised, for example. Both male and female circumcision is still fairly common in KwaNdebele and male teachers who have not been circumcised do not easily earn the respect of students who have, or of their parents.

Parents and Traditional Authorities (TA's) are often unsympathetic to SADTU which has a strong following among teachers, particularly younger, urban based teachers. Teachers, on the other hand, often oppose the representation of TA's on school governing councils, specifically, and the use of school management councils rather than PTSA's. Teachers are often supported by civics in their rejection of SMC's, which are seen as vehicles of TA authority (Interview with Circuit Manager). These tensions have led to conflict between teachers and traditional authorities which is taken up in a broader conflict between civics and TA's.

An incident which illustrates these tensions occurred in 1992. Teachers opposed the intervention of a traditional authority in the selection of a primary school principal. The TA had used his political influence to prescribe to the Education Department who should be appointed. The TA then attempted to have teachers who opposed his decision expelled and SADTU came out on strike in support of the teachers. Students supported SADTU while parents remained fairly passive. The matter was finally resolved when a crisis committee was set up to mediate between opposing parties (Interview with senior KDEC official).

Conflicting social hierarchies of authority and status have implications for the democratisation of school governance structures in the region. Teachers, students (at secondary level), traditional authorities and parents all assert their right to participate in school governance structures:

- * Teachers are organised and relatively well educated. Over 80% of teachers are under the age of 34 and the majority commute from urban areas. Young, urban based teachers tend to be drawn towards the more activist SADTU rather than the more conservative TUATA.
- * Traditional authorities still wield considerable powers in relation to schooling and other areas of community life.
- * Students have established a strong tradition of political organisation within schools and it is not uncommon for students to take the law into their own hands when they are dissatisfied with developments in schools. The 1991 KwaNdebele Education Department Annual Report cites numerous examples of cases in which students have 'ejected' teachers or principals.

* Parents are, arguably, in the weakest position of all the stakeholders in school governance. Parents are frequently absent (as commuters or migrants) and those who are present are often the least educated, poorest members of the community. The KDEC Secretary for Education and Circuit Managers interviewed for this research saw parent passivity as one of the major problems facing the reconstruction of education in the region (Interviews and the 1991 KDEC Annual Report).

Potential tensions between teachers, TA's and parents may be exacerbated or alleviated depending on other factors such as ideological compatibility between different groupings. The Moutse area adjacent to KwaNdebele provides an example. Here, the TA has won the support of both parents and teachers (most of whom are commuters and active SADTU supporters) regarding community support for schooling. The TA, who is known as an ANC activist, has taken advantage of the political unity forged when the Moutse community opposed incorporation into KwaNdebele and drawn teachers, parents and students into a school support programme. The success of this programme is evident in high standard ten results at all the local secondary schools in the area.

The ongoing surge in population numbers has also impacted on education in the region, with the education department struggling unsuccessfully to provide classrooms and teachers as fast as the population increases. Shack settlements mushroom up in a matter of weeks where there were no settlements before, or existing areas grow so that the enrolment at schools, such as the Verena school in the Kwaggafontein district, multiply tenfold in two years (Interview with circuit manager).

Residents who move into the region and establish new settlements must fall under a local authority - either a civic or a TA - in order to obtain a school, since the education department would not respond to requests for a school if these are made through a local authority. Thus schooling and social services become sites for competition between conflicting political authority structures for the allegiance of new communities.

With the abandonment of the bantustan system the tensions within the social relations of the school and the issue of school governance will be taken up within new provincial education departments. It is likely that these tensions and issues will be approached in quite different ways depending on whether a school falls within or outside a proclaimed township and on whether it falls in the PWV or the Eastern Transvaal.

THE PROVINCIAL CONTEXT

At the time of writing (September 1994) the boundary between the PWV and the Eastern Transvaal is not settled. One proposed boundary would cut Kwandebele in two, while others would place the whole Kwandebele in the Eastern Transvaal. The former would place the more densely populated south-western portion (including KwaMhlanga and Ekangala) in the PWV, while the north-eastern portion will fall in the Eastern Transvaal. No matter where exactly this boundary is placed, most of those who fall to the east of it are likely to protest. The majority of people who live in Kwandebele commute to the PWV

for work and the advantages of living in the PWV where the personal income per capita averages R4 992 rather than in the Eastern Transvaal where it averages R2 164 will not be lost on them (Figures from DBSA 1994b). A DBSA report assesses the Eastern Transvaal Province as having promising economic prospects but a record of poor social provision; KwaNdebele residents would know from experience what the relative advantages and disadvantages of each province would be. Murray, Ritchken and others have argued that conflicts in KwaNdebele in the last four decades have been largely about access to the metropolis, and the issue of provincial boundaries may be seen as a further chapter in this struggle. But there are some whose interests would be better served by the inclusion of KwaNdebele in the Eastern Transvaal, such as the traditional authorities who would have a stronger voice in a more rural province where they could join with traditional authorities in other regions.

The PWV region has a very different education profile from the Eastern Transvaal, both in terms of what the system provides and in terms of what families can afford to contribute. According to the 1994 White Paper (first, unpublished version) the 1993 average pupil teacher ratio in the PWV was 29:1 compared to 37:1 in the Eastern Transvaal. If only Africans are taken into account the difference is less marked but still significant, with a ratio of 37:1 in the PWV and 40:1 in the Eastern Transvaal. The differences are qualitative as well as quantitative: according to Edupol (June 1994) 29% of teachers in the Eastern Transvaal are unqualified as opposed to only three percent in the PWV. Families in the PWV are, on average, better placed to contribute financially to the schooling of their children: whereas the average household expenditure (African only) on tuition fees per primary school student in the PWV is R94 per annum, it is R31 in the Eastern Transvaal (SALDRU study, 1994).

With a higher per capita household and individual income and higher per capita productivity rates, the PWV is in a position to promise and provide better material conditions for its residents than the Eastern Transvaal (DBSA 1994a). The PWV province is not carrying any other former bantustans and present levels of education resources are higher than those of the Eastern Transvaal. It should be in a better position to redress education backlogs in KwaNdebele than the Eastern Transvaal which will be carrying Kangwane (where PCR's are even higher than in KwaNdebele) and parts of Lebowa and Gazankulu as well. The backlog in the provision of classrooms is a particularly urgent problem in all the former bantustan regions. In 1991 the PCR in the region that now constitutes the Eastern Transvaal averaged 42:1 compared to 34:1 in the PWV (Edusource June 1994 and the 1994 White Paper, unpublished first version).

The MEC for education in the Eastern Transvaal sees the provision of school facilities in KwaNdebele as one of the most urgent priorities for education planning and provincial integration in the Eastern Transvaal. One of the first acts of the Eastern Transvaal education department was to make a submission requesting RDP funds for this purpose (Interview, 29 August 1994).

SECTION THREE

A Note on Data

The inadequacies of the South African education information system is evident in the figures relating to teachers in KwaNdebele. Different sources provide widely divergent figures for teacher numbers, and pupil teacher ratios (PTR's). It is well known that the collection of these statistics are subject to unintentional error and purposeful misrepresentation. According to officials interviewed for this research these problems are more likely to relate to learner numbers than to teacher numbers. The errors relating to learner numbers are likely to result in a combination of inflated and deflated numbers, for different reasons. Since the allocation of grants and benefits are based on the numbers of students in schools there is some temptation to exaggerate student numbers. On the other hand, data is collected at the beginning of the year. Since students have to pay their school fees when they register, they often only register later in the year when they have managed to acquire the fees (Based on interviews with a circuit manager).

There is no reason to believe that data about learner numbers from sources other than the KDEC are more accurate than KDEC numbers except in cases of inaccurate arithmetic in the processing of the data, since these numbers are collected through the same process.

It may be argued that the DNE data relating to teacher numbers should be more accurate than KDEC figures since these could be validated by numbers of salaries issued. The new provincial education authorities in the North West Province have found that this is not the case. According to the members of the North West Strategic Management Team numbers of salaries have not provided an accurate record of teacher numbers in that region, since up to ten percent of all teachers' cheques were issued to teachers who had resigned, moved or died (Address at the NW Education and Training Forum launch September 1994).

Statistics regarding schooling must be used with a keen sense of their meaning in context. Other reports written for this research have shown terms such as teachers and classrooms can be defined in divergent ways with implications for the calculation of TPR's and CPR's, for example. There are also significant differences in teacher and student numbers depending on the time of year when statistics were collected. The KwaNdebele PTR came down from 1:39 to 1:35 between March and September of 1994 (KDEC statistics).

This report will use figures provided by the KDEC where ever these are available since these are the closest to source and show a degree of consistency. While they are unlikely to be literally accurate, they do provide an indication of the broad picture and general trends. The figures are drawn from the available KDEC Annual Reports and from departmental records.

The most recent available KDEC Annual Report was produced for the year 1991. More recent information is drawn from internal KDEC statistics obtained from the regional office and from circuit managers.

SCHOOLING IN KWANDEBELE

This section of the report provides a profile of schooling in KwaNdebele. The picture that emerges is similar, in broad terms, to that which emerged in other former bantustans.

In late 1994 the KwaNdebele government and education department are still in place, though the process of restructuring towards a provincial system is underway. It seems likely that, initially at least, the same education officials will continue to operate in a new system in much the same way as in the old. The 1994 White Paper and interviews with the provincial MEC for education and members of his task team all suggest that the new system would initially focus on removing material inequalities in the system. Other kinds of problems and inherited practices that plagued the old KwaNdebele education system are likely to continue to undermine education in the region until they are explicitly addressed.

THE BUREAUCRACY

The KwaNdebele Education department was the second smallest of the former bantustan departments with 266 schools and an enrolment of just under 170 000 students in 1994. Apart from primary and secondary schools, it controlled seven preprimary schools, one technical college and one teacher training college. (There are many more preprimary schools in kwandebele but these are, effectively, 'private', i.e. not subsidised by the department.)

Circuit Profiles

Although KwaNdebele is small, there are significant differences between the six education circuits in the region. These result mainly from accessibility to the metropolitan complex and associated rates of population increase, the presence of proclaimed towns and the distribution of centres of political power. The following profiles show that there is some correlation between circuits considered to be 'more established and stable' and PTR's but that, in 1993 at any rate, these circuits did not produce the best standard ten results. The best results were achieved by schools in the towns of Ekangala and KwaMhlanga in the KwaMhlanga circuit.

* The South-Western circuits, which are closer to Pretoria and Johannesburg, have to contend with continuing population growth with associated social conditions such as burgeoning shack settlements and inadequate infrastructure.

- The KwaMhlanga circuit in the south is still experiencing an ongoing population influx but it has the advantage of being the site of the new capital, KwaMhlanga as well as Ekangala, near Bronkhorstspuit. High population growth rates are reflected in the highest 1994 CPR's for primary schools in the region (1:60). The circuit appears to have used its resources at the secondary level. Secondary school CPR's are the second lowest of the six circuits at 54:1 in spite of the high demographic growth (KDEC statistics). The management strategies within this circuit seem to be more sophisticated than in other circuits, as is evidenced in the circuit reports within the Annual Report and also in interviews for this research (See for example the 1991 Annual Report). In the 1993 examinations, the schools in this circuit either performed particularly well or particularly badly. Overall, the circuit achieved the best results with 34% of all students passing compared to 23% for the region.

- The Tweefontien Circuit in the South-West had below average PTR's and the worst profile in terms of 1993 standard ten results: only 18% of the circuit's students passed compared to 23% for the region (See examinations section). A circuit manager described this circuit as 'the fastest growing, closest to Pretoria, most volatile, with no proclaimed towns, the least political clout and a high proportion of commuting teachers'. Interestingly the primary CPR's are relatively low for this circuit at 1:41 compared to a regional average of 1:45. The circuit's secondary CPR is the second highest in the region at 1:58.

* The North-eastern circuits are more demographically stable and there are some signs of movement out of the eastern areas towards the west (Interviews).

- Weltevreden, in the North-east, is the stronghold of the Ndzundza royal household and the authority of the TA's is still fairly strong. This social cohesion, political influence and demographic stability is reflected in lower teacher pupil ratio's, the lowest CPR's for both primary and secondary schools and a higher proportion of permanent posts for teachers (KDEC statistics). In spite of these advantages and a general perception among circuit managers that this circuit is 'more stable', the circuit achieved the lowest proportion of standard ten passes in 1993 with only 18% of all students passing compared to an average of 23% for the region.

- Siyabuswa was the stronghold of the government and the seat of the capital prior to 1988. It still benefits from a relatively established population. Like the Weltevreden circuit, it had relatively low PTR's in 1992 and 1993 and CPR's which were below the regional average in both primary and secondary schools in 1994 (KDEC statistics). Nevertheless, like the Weltevreden circuit, it achieved below average results in the 1993 standard ten examinations with only 22% of standard ten passes compared to an average of 23% for the region.

* Kwaggafontein and Allemansdrift are the two remaining circuits.

- Kwaggafontein is located in central KwaNdebele. It falls midway in terms of PTR's and standard ten examination results. Its 1994 primary CPR was just above average but it had the highest secondary CPR in the region (KDEC statistics).

- Allemansdrift was described by a circuit manager as 'the most rural with the most dispersed schools and politically divided between four different traditional authorities'. Its 1994 primary CPR was very high at 1:50 but its secondary CPR was below average. Although it had the highest PTR's in 1993 its standard ten results were second only to those of KwaMhlanga with 30% of its standard ten students passing compared to an average of 23% for the region.

Volume Five of the Parson's Report (RSA 1993) which looked at the KwaNdebele Education Department called for the eradication of specific corrupt practices, better financial controls and more competent accountable management, especially at middle management level. Attempts have subsequently been made to improve financial accountability. The acting Director General acknowledges that the department has not yet managed to eradicate nepotistic and corrupt practices and the subjection of administrative decisions and planning to political considerations (Interview).

Administrative Capacity

As in the case of all the former bantustan education departments, renewal of the administration has been constrained by financial as well as political factors. Between 1986 and 1991 per capita spending on education in KwaNdebele was generally lower than in all the former bantustans other than KwaZulu, Kangwane and the Transkei, with some annual variation (SAIRR 1991/1992 and Edupol 1993). By 1994 the annual education budget allowed a negligible amount of money for classroom building in spite of a huge and growing shortage of classrooms (Interview and ETP-DET 1994).

The following table compares 1991 per pupil spending on education, and on teachers specifically, for KwaNdebele to spending in all South African education departments and in all 'black' education departments.

Comparison between KwaNdebele, All South Africa and All 'Black' Departments (1991) Regarding,

- Per capita expenditure
- Expenditure on teachers per pupil (ETPP)

	KwaNd per cap	KwaNd ETPP	All SA per cap	All SA ETPP	BI Dept Per cap	BI Dpt ETPP
Prim	R 858	R 583	R1 121	R 780	R 786	R 582
Sec	R 990	R 630	R1 960	R1 277	R1 298	R 890
Total	R 904	R 599	R1 357	R 919	R 926	R 666

(From DBSA 1993b)

A lack of political accountability, material resources and management capacity have proven mutually reinforcing. For example, the KDEC does not have a computer system

to support administrative tasks such as data collection and the issuing of salary cheques, although millions of Rands have been wasted on maladministration and corruption. Consequently more money is lost due to inefficient administration of salaries and inadequately informed planning (ETP-DET 1994). Administrative inefficiency is evidenced in other areas of administration as well, for example in the fact that text books for 1994 had not yet all been delivered to schools in September of that year. This no doubt will contribute to high failure rates in the schools which will have a high cost in material as well as human terms.

On the plus side, the KwaNdebele Education Department has developed more positive relationships with teacher and student unions and civics than have many of the other former bantustan education departments subsequent to 1988. Apart from its long standing recognition of TUATA, the Department entered recognition agreements with SADTU and NEHAWU in 1993 (ETP-DET 1994). This experience of negotiating with extra departmental groupings has eased the entry of department officials into the Eastern Transvaal provincial task teams, provincial education and training forums and local education and training forums which have been set up in the region in recent months.

The participation of KwaNdebele Education Department officials in the provincial restructuring process has given them the opportunity to attempt to ensure that their interests are protected in the formation of a new Eastern Transvaal Education Department. Within the KDEC itself, there has been considerable activity to ensure that officials such as subject advisors will enter the new provincial system on the best possible terms. Some of the KDEC officials who have participated in the restructuring process have also argued for the continued participation of TA's in school governance. These examples refute the simplistic assumption that the former bantustan departments will simply disappear once the new provincial systems are in place. The new Provincial Education Department will reflect the concerns and interests of officials from within the old departments who have had a strong influence on the shaping of the new.

TEACHERS IN KWANDEBELE

The position of teachers within the broader social relations of schooling in KwaNdebele is discussed above. In this section, more quantitative information concerning teachers in KwaNdebele is drawn together. The overall picture that emerges in the report as a whole is of a predominantly young, predominantly female, predominantly urban based commuting teaching population at odds with the conservative, rural context in which they find themselves. In a fast expanding system, more remote and less established schools struggle to draw teachers with an acceptable level of appropriate qualifications while those who do commute from the towns and cities on a daily basis are constrained by transport problems such as taxi wars.

The issue of commuting teachers and the resulting alienation of teachers from school communities raises the question of what would be required to persuade teachers to live where they work. This question has not been systematically explored in this research

although a few teachers have indicated that they would be more willing to live in the place where they worked if there were better material infrastructure (such as running water and electricity), better schools for their own children, better working conditions and the possibility of utilising housing subsidies in rural areas.

TEACHER PUPIL RATIO'S

The 1994 overall Teacher Pupil Ratio (TPR) in KwaNdebele in March 1994 was 1:39, including unqualified teachers (KDEC 1994). This ratio had increased from 36:1 in 1990 to 1:41 in 1992 and has remained at 1:39 in the two subsequent years (KDEC Annual Reports).

Calculating separate primary and secondary TPR's in KwaNdebele is complicated by the fact that a number of primary schools have been extended to offer standard six and seven classes when secondary schools are not available. In 1994 over 6000 out of a total of 66 175 secondary school students (10%) are accommodated at primary schools. It is not known how many of the primary school teachers have been allocated to teach these students. Consequently there are two ways to calculate separate primary and secondary TPR's in KwaNdebele schools:

- a) To include the secondary students who are at primary schools in the primary school total, in order to reflect actual conditions in the schools and
- b) to include these students in the secondary totals to reflect the shortage of staff at the secondary level.

	(a)	(b)
Primary PTR	40:1	38:1
Secondary PTR	36:1	40:1

Although these ratio's are not exceptionally high, the range in average class sizes for individual schools is very wide indicating that many classes are in fact unacceptably large. The following table shows the average TPR's for each of the six circuits as well as the range of TPR's at schools within the circuit. The average ratio's include secondary school learners located in primary schools in the primary totals, as in (a) above.

March 1994 TPR's by Circuit

Circuit	Level	Primary	Secondary
Weltevreden	Average	1:37	1:30
	Range	1:27-1:52	1:19-1:43
Siyabuswa	Average	1:39	1:34
	Range	1:27-1:53	1:25-1:117
Kwaggafontein	Average	1:41	1:35
	Range	1:21-1:60	1:23-1:78
Tweefontein	Average	1:36	1:37
	Range	1:21-1:48	1:27-1:135
KwaMhlanga	Average	1:46	1:40
	Range	1:20-1:71	1:27-1:64
Allemansdrift	Average	1:44	1:42
	Range	1:25-1:93	1:30-1:65

The proportion of schools with low or very high ratio's is substantial: In March 1994 nearly 12% of all schools had a PTR over 1:50 while nearly 20% had a PTR under 1:30. Factors which contribute to the diversity of PTR's include classroom pupil ratio's, the much faster rate at which numbers of learners are growing in some areas, the difficulty of drawing teachers to schools at a greater distance from the metropolitan area and proclaimed towns and the greater political influence of some areas. The wide diversity in ratio's suggests either an inability or an unwillingness on the part of the KDEC to control the factors which advantage some schools and disadvantage others in relation to PTR's.

The inability of many schools to obtain and maintain an adequate number of appropriately qualified teachers does not only result in large classes. Many schools do not have the continuity of a core of permanent senior members of staff which is required to develop the school rather than simply to cope with day to day matters in an ad hoc way. The 1991 Annual Report for the KwaMhlanga circuit illustrates this problem in its account of senior positions in the circuit's schools:

- a) 26 of the 39 posts for principals were filled by acting principals
- b) Only 4 of the 10 deputy principal posts in the circuit were filled.
- c) Only 17 of the 59 Head of Department posts in the circuit had been filled and all of these in an acting capacity.

Teacher Qualifications

In 1994 92% of teachers were regarded as qualified, in the sense that they had a teachers certificate or diploma (DET-ETP 1994). Actual qualifications are not stipulated in KDEC sources but it is likely that a large proportion of these were underqualified. The following table pertaining to 1991 shows that, while 54% of all teachers in KwaNdebele were qualified, only 46% had an M+3 qualification.

Teacher Qualifications: KwaNdebele 1991 (from DBSA 1993)

	% of Males	% of Females	% of Total
Unqualified	20	19	20
Underqual.	29	37	34
M+3 or above	51	43	46

Teachers: Gender

Underqualified teachers tend to be older teachers who obtained certificates prior to the mid-eighties when these qualifications were phased out in the colleges. KwaNdebele is similar to other former bantustans in that a higher proportion of this group are female. This implies that, in 1991, more female than male teachers had remained in service since the mid eighties and have not upgraded their qualifications.

The gender profile of the teacher population in KwaNdebele is also similar to that of other former bantustans in other respects:

- a) Female teachers are in a majority in the primary schools and in the profession as a whole but not in the secondary schools

Teachers and Gender 1994

	Primary (%)	Secondary (%)	Total (%)
Male	828 (31%)	991 (60%)	1 819 (42%)
Female	1 843 (69%)	664 (30%)	2 507 (58%)
Total	2 671 (100%)	1 655 (100%)	4 326 (100%)

(Based on statistics provided by the KDEC 1994)

b) Female teachers are in a majority at the lowest post level and in a minority at all other post levels. There were seven post levels in the KwaNdebele school system, with level one being the lowest post level. In 1991 women teachers constituted only 18% of teachers at post levels two to seven (DBSA 1993).

c) Female teachers also predominate on the lower salary scales while males tend to predominate on the higher salary scales. In 1991, for example, only 39% of all male teachers in KwaNdebele earned less than R13 000 pa while over 70% of all female teachers fell into this bracket (DBSA 1993).

Teachers and Age

KwaNdebele has had a very young teacher population. In 1991, 87% of all teachers were under the age of 34 (DBSA 1993). According to officials interviewed for this research in 1994, many principals were under the age of 30. The following factors have contributed to this:

a) Because of a high rate of expansion, the schooling system has had to draw in new, usually young, teachers

b) Teachers who qualified in the last decade tend to have higher qualifications than those who qualified earlier, since colleges have phased out certificates in favour of diplomas. This gives younger teachers an advantage in the competition for posts.

c) Many teachers would rather teach in the PWV metropolis than in KwaNdebele while others use teaching as a stepping stone to more lucrative employment outside the education system. Consequently older teachers move out of KwaNdebele or of teaching and are replaced by younger teachers who cannot find employment elsewhere.

STUDENTS

The KDEC had to contend with high, fluctuating growth rates in student numbers throughout the early eighties. Primary school growth rates have stabilised in the last eight years. Secondary school growth rates have dropped but are still high as is shown in the following table.

Percentage Increase in Student Numbers

a	81	82	83	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92	93	9
b	25	20	14	10	7	2	2	-2	5	3	3	2	2	1
c	43	26	27	22	16	17	18	17	20	15	12	10	6	8
d	27	21	16	12	9	5	6	3	9	7	6	5	3	3

a - Year

b - Primary schools

c - Secondary Schools

d - Total

(1980 to 1991 based on DBSA 1993
1992 to 1994 based on KDEC statistics)

The average growth rate for the primary and secondary levels gives some indication of fluctuations in numbers. These fluctuations are much greater for specific levels, for example for Sub A, reflecting KwaNdebele's turbulent history as well as the effects of developments in the wider South African context on KwaNdebele. Between 1984 and 1990 Sub A enrolments swung up and down with decreases in 1985, 1986, 1988 and 1990 and increases in other years. There was an overall increase of only 4% from 1991 to 1994.

Sub A enrolment: Percentage increases and decreases

a) 1981 to 1987

Year	81	82	83	84	85	86	87
%	41	8	5,5	7,3	-3,2	-4,2	8,5

b) 1988 to 1994

Year	88	89	90	91	92	93	94
%	-4,3	-2,2	7,6	4,9	2,9	-3,7	1,4

(1980 to 1991 Based on statistics from DBSA 1993

1992 to 1994 Based on KDEC statistics)

The overall rate of enrolment increase for all standards slows down around 1986 and 1988 presumably because of political developments within KwaNdebele.

Cohort Sizes

As is to be expected, there is a decrease in the size of each cohort from sub a to standard ten. Contrary to expectation, however there is not a decrease in each of the consecutive years for any given cohort. Instead there are consistent increases in cohort numbers at particular levels. Cohort increases tend to take place in KwaNdebele and in other former bantustans at particular levels:

- a) standards two to three,
- b) standards five to six and
- c) standards nine to ten.

In the case of KwaNdebele there are also increases at standard one level, which have not been observed elsewhere. The following table shows the scale of these increases, according to gender.

The increases and decreases in cohort numbers can be illustrated by the figures for the group that finished standard ten in 1994:

Year	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
Level	Sub A	Sub B	Std 1	Std 2	Std 3	Std 4	std 5
No	15 181	13625	14 459	12 544	12 884	10 836	10837

Year	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994
Level	Std 6	Std 7	Std 8	Std 9	Std 10
No	12 832	11 464	10 664	10 927	13 214

(1983 to 1991 based on DBSA 1993

1992 to 1994 based on KDEC statistics)

The increases and decreases are not arbitrary. They conform to an established pattern of enrolments for KwaNdebele and other former bantustans. The following table shows a consistent pattern of enrolment increases within a cohort at the four relevant levels.

Percentage enrolment increases of cohort size in consecutive years 1990 to 1994

		1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	Ave.
Sub B	Male	4	7,4	2	2,2	3	3,7
-Std1	Female	2,8	7	3	2	2	3,4
Std 2	Male	8,2	7,1	4	8,6	4,3	6,4
- 3	Female	8,6	3,3	3,6	9	6,9	6,3
Std 5	Male	14,3	15,8	24,6	19	18,3	18,4
- 6	Female	22	21,6	26	26,4	22,2	23,6
Std 9	Male	19	17,9	11,4	3,6	17,2	13,8
- 10	Female	16	22	21	18	23,9	20,2

(1990 to 1991 Based on DBSA 1993

1992 to 1994 based on KDEC statistics)

a) Standard one enrolments have been higher than sub B enrolments for the preceding year every year from 1980 to 1994 excepting 1986.

b) Standard three enrolments have been higher than standard two enrolments for preceding years every year from 1983 to 1994. Prior to 1988 this increase tended to be higher for males but this pattern is no longer consistently present.

c) Standard six enrolments have been higher than standard five enrolments for the preceding years every year from 1984 to 1994 excepting 1986. Since 1987 the increase has been consistently greater for females.

d) Standard ten enrolments have been higher than standard nine enrolments for the preceding years every year from 1987 to 1994, excepting 1988. Since 1990 the increase has been consistently greater for females.

There are a number of possible explanations for this phenomenon:

- intakes from outside the region, particularly at times when there were political disturbances elsewhere. This does not explain why this phenomenon occurs in the total enrolment for all 'black' departments in some years. This occurred in 1988, 1990 and

1991 for standard three's and in 1988, 1989, 1990 and 1991 for standard sixes. At standard ten level, however, total cohort numbers for all 'black' departments dropped every year from 1976 to 1991. Since there was no overall increase across all departments, it is possible that increases in KDEC standard ten enrolments resulted partly from intakes from other departments at this level (Statistics from DBSA 1993).

- increases in failure and repeater rates, especially at the levels where this phenomenon occurs i.e. standards three, six and ten. This would not explain the consistency of the phenomenon across time.

- intakes from outside the system within the region i.e. the return of drop outs. This would imply that drop-outs do not necessarily enter the system at the level at which they leave. Instead they tend to enter at the beginning of an institutional block - senior primary or secondary school - or in the year of the final examination. This would help to explain the increases at standard three, six and ten level but not at standard one level.

Sub A's

In KwaNdebele, as in other former bantustans, the greatest decrease in cohort size regularly occurs at Sub A level. The following table shows Sub B enrolments as a percentage of the previous year's Sub A enrolment for the years 1988 to 1994. The same ratio is shown for all former 'black' departments for 1988 to 1991.

Sub B Enrolments as a Percentage of the Previous Year's Sub A Enrolment: KDEC compared to total for all 'black' departments.

	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994
KwaNd	91	87	87	86	85	84
All	76	77	77			

(1989 to 1991 based on DBSA 1993

1992 to 1994 based on KDEC statistics)

These figures show that a **minimum** of 16% of 1993 sub A's either repeated Sub A in 1994 or dropped out before March 1994. The actual percentage is likely to be much higher, since the Sub B total includes repeaters from the 1993 Sub B year as well as returning drop outs. Unfortunately actual percentage cannot be calculated since drop out, repeater and failure rates are not readily available.

The net loss between Sub A and sub B is not yet as great in KwaNdebele as in most other departments, as can be seen from the percentages for all 'black' departments provided in the table. It is nevertheless disturbing to note that the percentage of students who do not move from Sub A to Sub B has been rising steadily since 1989.

Out of School Children and Youth

According to DBSA estimates, about 12% of the potential school enrolment were out of school in 1991, amounting to just over 20 000 children and youth (DBSA 1993b).

An examination of two age groups - 10 to 14 and 15 to 19 - gives a similar but more detailed picture as is shown by the following table:

	a) Potential	b) Enrolled	b as % of a
Ages 10 to 14	54 079	49 100	91
Ages 15 to 19	52 631	44 212	84

(Based on DET 1992 and Census Data)

According to these calculations, nearly 5 000 between the ages of 10 and 14 and over 8 400 between the ages of 15 and 19 were out of school in 1991.

The term 'out of school children' implies a fairly static meaning - that any given child is permanently 'in' or 'out' of school. I have argued in reports on other regions (Lebowa Report 1993) that this is not generally the case. Students tend rather to drop in and out intermittently. The enrolment statistics used in the paragraphs and table above were collected in March 1991. September enrolment figures for 1991 are not available. In 1993 the net loss of students between March and September was 5%. If it is assumed that the net loss in 1991 was the same percentage it would follow that a further 5 300 students in these age groups would have been 'out of school' by the end of the year. This would have brought the total number of 'out of school' children and youth between 10 and 19 to nearly 19 000.

The net loss of students due to 'drop outs' and 'drop ins' varies considerably from one circuit to another. In primary schools the net loss varied from 2% in the Allemansdrift and Tweefontein circuits to 5% in the Weltevrede circuits, according to KDEC records. In secondary schools there was a net loss of only 2% in the Siyabuswa circuit compared to 7% in KwaMhlanga, according to these records. At some levels in particular circuits, these records show a small net **gain** during this period, for example for Sub A in the Allemansdrift circuit. All of this points to the likelihood that there is a substantial movement in and out of schools during the year.

Enrolment and Age

The proportion of students that may be considered to be 'over age' is higher in KwaNdebele than the average for all the SGT's. Eight percent of all KwaNdebele

students, and 21% of secondary students were 20 or over in 1993. In the SGT's as a whole, six percent of all students and 18% of secondary students were 20 or over in the same year (DET 1994).

The proportion of students that were 17 or over in primary schools in KwaNdebele in 1993 was 2,4% - nearly double the average for all the SGT's which was 1,4% (DET 1994).

The recent government White Paper proposed that over age students be shifted into 'cheaper alternative forms of education' (RSA 1994). In KwaNdebele this would apply to nearly 13 000 students, according to 1993 statistics. If those who are presently 'out of school' but who would want to return to school are taken into account, this figure could be much higher. The KDEC has already begun to introduce 'finishing schools' for older secondary school students. These schools may provide useful information regarding the feasibility of this approach. It is not clear, however, how this approach would apply to younger 'over age' students. What would happen, for example, to a ten year old student in Sub B?

Enrolment and Gender

KwaNdebele enrolment patterns are similar to those of other former bantustans and the former DET in that there tend to be more males at the lower levels, up to standard two, and more females in standard three and above (DBSA 1993). This pattern has been established in the KDEC for sub A to standard nine since 1980 and for standard ten since 1985. The following table shows the relative percentages of males and females in 1994.

	SA	SB	S1	S2	S3	S4	S5	S6	S7	S8	S9	10
M	53	54	53	51	50	49	47	47	45	46	45	43
F	47	46	47	49	50	51	53	53	55	54	55	57

A lack of information regarding pass and repeater rates for different levels, by gender, is particularly frustrating in any attempt to explain these gender discrepancies. Information regarding the age of students at each level is also not available by gender. The Government's recent draft White Paper on Education has proposed that a new education and training information system be introduced. It is hoped that the approach within the proposed new system would be more gender sensitive than past approaches have been.

I have argued in reports on other regions that a larger proportion of one gender at a particular level does not necessarily indicate a smoother run through the system for that group; it may in fact indicate the opposite. A higher proportion of one gender may indicate that there are more repeaters and a greater intake from outside the system (including returning drop outs). In the lower levels this would indicate higher numbers of repeaters

for boys who eventually drop out around standard two. In the higher levels this might indicate a tendency among females to persevere, to repeat after failing or to return after dropping out. I have argued elsewhere that gender differences in access to semi-skilled employment for students who have not passed standard ten may help to explain why females seem more determined to pass standard ten (Lebowa report 1993).

The gender breakdown of cohort increases is interesting in this regard in that it confirms that there is a greater intake and/or repeater rate for males in the lower levels and for females in the higher levels.

The drop out figures for 1993 support the thesis that girls progress through the system more smoothly in the lower levels while males progress more smoothly through the system in the higher levels.

* In that year six percent of secondary female students dropped out between March and September while only 3% of male secondary students dropped out during this period (Based on KDEC statistics for drop outs, though internal arithmetic was corrected).

* In 1993 2,4% of boys in sub A to standard two dropped out between March and September as compared to 1,8% of girls (Based on KDEC statistics).

KDEC circuit managers interviewed for this report suggested that circumcision is a significant factor affecting intermittent attendance of secondary schools. According to one circuit manager school attendance of both males and females is affected by annual circumcision practices. In addition, there is a major 'circumcision school' every four years which involves larger numbers of males for longer periods than the annual events. Circumcision practices do not only affect school attendance in terms of the time that is consumed. They are also very expensive and parents may have to choose between spending money on ordinary schooling or circumcision school if they cannot afford both.

Circuit managers also perceived pregnancy to be an important factor affecting student drop out rates.

CURRICULUM

The school curriculum has been very narrow in KwaNdebele, as in most former bantustans. This is evident in the range of subjects on offer to standard ten students in 1994 (KDEC statistics).

a) All students took three languages selected from English (100%), Afrikaans (93%), Zulu (69%), North Sotho (29%), and Tswana (2%). (Isindebele has been introduced as a subject in the lower standards only. It is due to be offered at standard ten level from 1996.)

b) The majority of standard ten students also took Biology (82%), and Biblical Studies or Religious education (71%)

c) Remaining subjects were most often chosen from the following: History (proportion unknown: probably around 35%), Agricultural Science (32%), Geography (32%),

Business Economics (29%), Economics (13%), Mathematics (18%) and Physical Science (11%).

d) Fewer than 10% of all standard ten students did the remaining subjects: Accounting (9%), Needlework (3%), Home Economics (2%) and Commercial Mathematics (1%).

These statistics indicate that the majority of students took English, Afrikaans, Zulu, Biology, Biblical studies and one other subject chosen from History, Agricultural Science and Geography. Officials regard these subjects as soft options which do not provide a very useful preparation for further study or work. Often the less well resourced schools are unlikely to offer any other options since a wider range of options requires the capacity to draw teachers of 'scarce subjects', more complicated staff arrangements and subject specific teaching rooms and equipment. Subjects such as Mathematics, Physical Science and the Business subjects are most often offered in the better resourced schools in proclaimed towns.

Officials in the KDEC are concerned about the low number of students who do mathematics and science. The department has followed a trend also evident in other departments in that it has established a 'science school'. Students who show an aptitude for these subjects are selected to attend this school in the Siyabuswa circuit. An attempt has been made to draw the best available staff to this school, according to a deputy director (Interview).

Examination Results

Very little information is available regarding results other than standard ten final examination results. Attempts to obtain other results from KDEC head office and circuit offices were unsuccessful. The available information regarding standard ten results is also scanty. It is not possible to disaggregate results according to gender, for example.

Standard ten results have been unacceptably low throughout the KDEC's period of administration. In 1982, when only ten KwaNdebele schools offered standard ten, only 36% of those who wrote passed the examination. Ten years later, in 1992, when the number of schools had grown to 53 the proportion that passed was similar at 34%. The following year only 23% passed. The department had its best results in 1987 and 1988 when 55% of those who wrote passed (KDEC statistics).

The proportion of standard tens who obtained a matriculation exemption has generally been between 5% and 10% with a higher proportion in 1987 (13%) and 1988 (12%). In 1993 only 3% of those who wrote obtained a matriculation exemption (KDEC statistics).

The standard ten results are even worse when they are seen in relation to the proportion of students who drop out before writing the examination. In 1993 7% of those who registered for the examinations did not actually write (KDEC statistics).

There is clearly a wide divergence between the results obtained by individual schools. In

1993, for example, when only 23% of all students in KwaNdebele passed standard ten, individual schools had pass rates varying from 3% to 65% (KDEC statistics).

The 1993 standard ten results seem to correlate more closely with location (in terms of circuits) than with other identifiable factors such as TPR's. The KwaMhlanga circuit (seat of the KwaNdebele capital) achieved the best results. In 1993 only eight schools in KwaMhlanga offered standard ten. Of these, four were among the five schools which had the highest proportion of passes in the region. At the other end of the spectrum, Tweefontein, with 10 schools offering standard ten, achieved the worst results. At eight of the Tweefontein schools the proportion of students that passed was lower than the average for the region; amongst these were the three schools with the lowest proportion of passes in the region (Based on KDEC statistics).

Circuit	% Std 10 Passes in 1993
KwaMhlanga	30%
Allemandrift	24%
Kwaggafontein	24%
Siyabuswa	22%
Weltevreden	18%
Tweefontein	18%

Based on KDEC statistics

A correlation between standard ten results and PTR's is not evident in the 1993 standard ten results for KwaNdebele. In 1993 the average TPR in secondary schools was 1:35. While the nine schools with the best results all had ratio's of 1:35 or below the same applies to the nine schools with the worst results. The sixteen schools which had higher ratio's than this average were fairly evenly spread across the middle of the spectrum. This does not necessarily mean that TPR's are irrelevant. It is more likely that the particular reasons for a high or low TPR and the association of the TPR with different levels of other kinds of resources should be taken into account. For example, some schools have low TPR's because they are situated in fairly remote areas where there is a low population density. In such schools low TPR's are likely to be associated with a low level of infrastructural and material resources and, in some cases, with multi-grade classes. Other schools - such as proclaimed towns - have low TPR's because they have had an adequate number of posts allocated to them and are able to attract more teachers.

Finishing Schools

The KDEC has responded to the problem of high standard ten failure rates and a high proportion of repeaters and over age students in schools by introducing finishing schools to accommodate standard ten failures who wish to repeat the year. In 1994 there were three such schools, each in a different circuit (Allemandrift, Kwaggafontein and Siyabuswa). A circuit manager interviewed for this report was critical of this development on the grounds that it 'simply pooled unsuccessful and frustrated students.'

SCHOOLS AND CLASSROOMS IN KWANDEBELE

Types of School Facilities

The KDEC has abandoned the formal distinction between community and state schools. This was partly a response to changes in national education policies and financing practices in the late eighties, on the one hand, and to resistance to community financing from within KwaNdebele, on the other. In the mid eighties the KDEC tried - unsuccessfully - to replace the old R1 for R1 system with an annual levy (Imaliyomakho).

In recent years there has been some attempt, at least at the level of principle, to provide schools for all communities. In practice, there are clear differences in the physical quality of facilities provided in different localities and between schools built in different policy periods. The KDEC Director for Planning listed five categories of school facilities:

- a) Conventional classrooms costing about R35 000. According to this official, only this type of classroom has been built 'since the election'.
- b) Steel structures costing about R33 000 per classroom
- c) PreFabricated structures with floors costing around R33 000
- d) PreFabricated structures without floors costing about R28 000

The full range of classroom types are not easily tracked at the level of formal policy but are evident in frequent references to a variety of school types in informal discussions and interviews with teachers. These include:

- 'Shack schools'. A 1994 report by the Chief Director indicates that 334 classrooms including nine complete schools are "built with tin shack" (DET-ETP 1994 pg 8).
- 'Farm Schools'. These were DET farm schools prior to the creation of KwaNdebele. While they subsequently officially became community schools and then state schools, their facilities have never been improved.
- 'DET type' schools referring to schools with facilities built according to DET building standards which are higher than standards for most schools in KwaNdebele. There are three such schools in KwaNdebele according to the Director responsible for planning : Mphalali Secondary (Kwaggafontein circuit), Vezilwazi Secondary (Siyabuswa circuit) and KwaMhlanga Secondary (KwaMhlanga circuit).
- The Ekangala Comprehensive School built by the DET before Ekangala was

incorporated into KwaNdebele. Two teachers interviewed for this report described the comprehensive school as 'double story buildings with electricity, proper toilets and all the necessary equipment'. An senior official confirmed that this school was exceptional and 'has two laboratories'.

- 'Stop Nonsense Schools', referring to temporary structures erected quickly to pre-empt protests at the lack of facilities).

An overall 1994 CPR of 1:49 (based on permanent classrooms only) bears witness to the fact that the KDEC has not managed to provide sufficient classrooms in spite of its repertoire of differentiated standards.

Classroom Pupil Ratio's

The KDEC follows a practice - common among former bantustan education departments - of counting permanent and temporary classrooms separately. Since most of the temporary classrooms are, quite literally, shacks, only permanent classrooms are taken into account when CPR's are calculated. The overall CPR for the region was 1:49 in 1994. Separate CPR's for primary and secondary schools can be calculated in two different ways:

a) The 6 000 odd secondary students accommodated at primary schools can be included in the primary total. This would most accurately reflect conditions in the schools.

b) These 6 000 students can be included in the secondary total. This would more accurately reflect actual shortages at each level.

1994 CPR's: a) Primary CPR - 1:48
 Secondary CPR - 1:51

 b) Primary CPR - 1:45
 Secondary CPR - 1:56

(Based on KDEC statistics)

(In the following calculations all secondary students are included in the secondary total as for (b) regardless of whether they are accommodated at primary or secondary schools.)

There was considerable variation in 1994 CPR's across circuits as is shown in the table below:

	Best Circuit	Worst Circuit
Primary	Weltevrede 1:39	KwaMhlanga 1:60
Secondary	Weltevrede 1:52	Kwaggafontein 1:63

(KDEC Statistics 1994)

REFERENCES

- Argus. This New South Africa. 2 September 1994
- Bekker S, C Cross and N Bromberger. Rural Poverty in South Africa. Unpublished Report. University of Natal. January 1993.
- Bekker S and P Rainey. Trying to Talk About Talking: A KwaNdebele Case-study. Unpublished paper. UNISA 1988.
- Central Statistical Services. Population Census 1991. RSA.
- Egero B. South Africa's Bantustans. Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, 1991.
- DBSA. Education in the Eastern Transvaal. CPI Working Document. April 1994. (a)
- DBSA. Primary and Secondary Education in South Africa: Data, Policy Issues, Indicators and Scenario's. DBSA Dec 1993 b
- DBSA. Public Expenditure on Education in South Africa 1987/88 to 1991/92. Vol 2: Contextual Information. Nov 1993 a
- DBSA. South Africa's Nine Provinces: A Human Development Profile. April 1994. (b)
- DBSA. Statistical Abstracts 1990. May 1992.
- DET. 1991 Annual Report. RSA 1992.
- DET. 1993 Annual Report. RSA 1994.
- Eastern Transvaal Province Department of Education and Training. Report compiled by Dr P M Mahlangu. 1994.
- Edupol. Flow of Funds in South Africa - Unpublished. Urban Foundation. 1993.
- Goldblatt D, B Goldblatt and P van Niekerk. The Transported: a South African Odyssey. Centre for Documentary Studies. Duke University. 1989
- Graaff JF. The Present State of Urbanisation in the South African Homelands in *Development Southern Africa* Vol 4 No 1 1987.
- Haysom Nicholas. Mabangala: The Rise of Right Wing Vigilantes in South Africa. Centre for Applied Legal Studies. Wits. 1986
- Jarvis D. Turmoil in the Homelands in *Indicator SA* Vol 7 No 3 1990.
- McCaul Colleen. Satellite in Revolt. KwaNdebele: An Economic and Political Profile. SAIRR 1987.
- Murray C. Displaced Urbanisation: The Case of KwaNdebele. Unpublished Paper. 1986.
- Pienaar H. Die Derde OORlog teen Die Mapochs.
- Ritchken E. The KwaNdebele Struggle Against Independence in *South African Review* 5
- RSA. Eerste Verslag Van Die Kommissie Van Ondersoek Na Die Beweerde Wanbestuur in KwaNdebele. September 1991.
- RSA. Fyfde Verslag van die Kommissie van Ondersoek na die 1986 Onluste en Beweerde Wanbestuur in KwaNdebele: Verslag aan die Staatspresident. Augustus 1993.
- RSA. White Paper on Education. September 1994.
- SAIRR. Race Relations Survey 1991/1992. 1992.
- SALDRU. Regional poverty Profile: Eastern and Northern Transvaal. Cape Town 1993
- SALDRU. South Africa's Rich and Poor: Baseline Household Statistics. August 1994.
- TRAC in *Cobbett and Cohen Popular Struggles in South Africa*

Van Niekerk P. The Bus Stop Republic. in Goldblatt et al op cit.

Link pupils to classrooms

The practice of extending primary schools suggests that there are insufficient secondary schools, that the classroom building programme is not keeping pace with the need for secondary school classrooms and that primary schools are more open to accommodating excess students than are secondary schools. It is possible that the location of schools contributes to this. Historically the community school mode of provision allowed communities to establish primary schools wherever they saw the need while there tended to be more control of secondary schools which were also more often established at the initiative of the education departments. Communities that had established primary schools were able to insist that no students were excluded while education departments were in a stronger position to limit the PTR's at secondary schools.