

- * The singability (simplicity of the melody) of the song.
- * Musical structure of the song:
 - Form
 - Melody
 - Rhythm
 - Harmony
- * Evaluation of the authenticity of the song.

5.4.5 The assessors were unanimously that although the six songs shortlisted were good, none of them could really pass for an anthem. They had various technical deficiencies, especially in musical structure and form, and some lacked originality and authenticity.

5.4.6 The assessors suggested that since they could not find an acceptable new anthem, "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" and "Nkosi" be sung as dual anthems during the transitional period. They also suggested that adaptation of the texts should be considered where necessary, and that the texts of both songs should be translated into the various languages of South Africa to allow the songs to be used by as broad a community as possible.

5.6 Recommendations

The Commission recommends:

5.6.1 That the music of "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" and "Die Stem van Suid-Afrika" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period. The Commission further recommends that the Negotiating Council consider translations, adaptations and standardisation of the lyrics of these songs, where necessary.

5.6.2 That the composition and lyrics for "Vunwe" composed by S.J. Khosa be considered by the Negotiating Council as an alternative. Various translations suitable to the music should be considered.

5.6.3 That the Negotiating Council be urged to promote a process whereby further submissions for anthems for a new South Africa be elicited. The whole exercise of searching for a new anthem should be seen as a lengthy process which is in its initial phase, and while the songs to be submitted to the Negotiating Council for consideration would be for the transitional period, composers should generally be encouraged to continue with their work of composing an anthem for a new South Africa. The Commission also recommends that such a process should be sustained by the government of the day or any new government after elections.

5.7 Comments

5.7.1 Some of the submissions, lyrics and music merit recording and popularising and the Negotiating Council should consider ways and means of implementing this.

5.7.2 The Commission further recommends an educational drive aimed at:

5.7.2.1 Encouraging the general acceptance of the anthems by the whole spectrum of the South African public.

5.7.2.2 Popularising the anthems through radio, television and other media, including publishing.

5.7.2.3 A Committee to this end should be appointed by the Negotiating Council to sustain and to monitor the process.

6. Further Recommendations.

- 6.1 The Commission set in motion a process heightening the awareness and strengthening the notion of a collective South African identity. However, it is the Commission's considered opinion that much more time and effort are needed for this awareness to manifest in effective and more permanent national symbols, to make the South African public generally aware that we are moving towards common ground.
- 6.2 The Commission was particularly disturbed by the very poor participation. Although every effort was made to ensure as wide a public participation as possible within the severe time constraints, the process of informing and consulting the public could not attain the necessary momentum. It is also feared that there will not be sufficient opportunity for the broad population to become familiar with, debate and identify with the Commission's recommendations.
- 6.3 The fact that symbols are seen as "transitional" and therefore temporary has already created some uncertainty among the public, and this hampers the vital and essential process of public identification with the symbols. Furthermore, there are wide-ranging practical implications in the implementation of new symbols.
- 6.4 The Commission regards it as being of vital importance that the momentum gained in the present quest for national symbols be sustained through the immediate establishment by the Negotiating Council of a similar body or cultural forum to conduct and monitor ongoing processes; to invite broader public debate; to conduct further surveys and research on public reaction to

the Commission's recommendations; to initiate campaigns to educate the public about new symbols and to popularise proposed symbols as an integral part of nation building; to stimulate creative participation with special reference to the national anthem by means of competitions, music and choral festivals; to establish the role of regional symbols in a future dispensation.

6.5 The Commission wishes to express its appreciation to all members of the public who participated in this important initiative.

**MINORITY REPORT ON THE PROPOSED NATIONAL FLAG,
SUBMITTED BY PROF PH KAPP**

I support designs 1, 3, 4 and 5 but not numbers 2 and 6 for the following reasons:

1. Number 2 is unacceptable to me because it represents a rather strange design for a flag and reminds me too much of the Red Cross symbolism.
2. Number 6 is unacceptable to me because it creates the impression of a gift wrap and the symbolism ascribed to the different colours (for example black representing energy and red suffering) is not acceptable. Colours are neutral and any forced effort to give a symbolic meaning to it, is not justified.

MINORITY REPORT ON NATIONAL ANTHEM

(Addendum to minority report)

We agree that both Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika and Die Stem be accepted during the Interim Period. However, in view of the fact that the words of Nkosi accord with the guidelines and those of Die Stem infringe on six of these, the words of Nkosi only should be sung, followed by the playing of a stanza of the music of Die Stem. Die Stem:

- * does not promote national unity (5.2.1.1)
- * it reflects on the history of a particular section of the South African population (5.2.1.6)
- * it does not promote a common South African nationalism (5.2.1.7)
- * it does not promote the idea of a common South African culture (5.2.1.8)
- * it does not move South Africans into a new common ground (5.2.1.9)
- * it does not promote a South African identity or a common patriotism (5.2.1.10)

This proposal is made to compromise knowing full well that the majority of the South African population favour Nkosi.

This proposal was accepted on Friday 15 October but in the absence of some members, it was changed on Monday. There are, thus, strong grounds for its reinstatement. We therefore, through this minority report, seek to re-instate this option.

Furthermore, we request the Council to mount an intensive campaign to ensure the fullest participation of the South African people in the process of deciding on a National Anthem.

COMMISSION ON NATIONAL SYMBOLS REPORT BY THE SUB-COMMITTEE ON THE NATIONAL ANTHEM.

CONVENOR: Dr Musa Xulu

15 October 1993

BACKGROUND

According to the recommendations made by the Commission on National Symbols about a possible future national anthem for the interim constitutional period, the following were guidelines agreed upon:

- * The anthem should express and promote national unity.
- * The composition should be original and submissions should be accompanied by lyrics in any of the languages of South Africa, by sheet music and or demonstration tape.
- * It may be submitted in staff notation or tonic solfa.

These guidelines were made known to the South African public when it was invited to participate in the process through press releases, media interviews, advertisements and correspondence.

The sub-committee further gave itself the following guidelines for the evaluation of the submitted anthems:

EVALUATION

1.1 THE TEXT OR LYRICS

- 1.1.1 The text or lyrics must be evaluated separately.
- 1.1.2 The text or lyrics must promote National unity.
- 1.1.3 The lyrics must be unique and original.
- 1.1.4 The lyrics must be in any of the South African languages including the languages of the TBVC States.
- 1.1.5 The lyrics must be given a South African context and relate to the fact that South Africa is a country in Africa.
- 1.1.6 The lyrics must not be about a particular period in history, nor must they promote a history of any particular section of the South African population.
- 1.1.7 The lyrics must promote a common South African Nationalism.
- 1.1.8 The lyrics must promote the idea of a common South African culture.
- 1.1.9 The lyrics must move all South Africans irrespective of race, colour, creed or gender into a new common ground.
- 1.1.10 The lyrics must promote patriotism, a South African identity, a South African solidarity, a loyalty to South Africa, God and fellow country men.

1.1.1f The lyrics must promote a sense of pride.

1.2 THE MUSIC

1.2.1 The music must be simple.

1.2.2 The melody must be derived from South African melodies, i.e. indigenous African or syncretic African/Western.

1.2.3 The music must reflect a musical meeting point between Africa and the West.

1.2.4 The melody must be singable to all people, without requiring any musical training.

1.2.5 The melody must be memorable.

1.3 THE SONG

1.3.1 There must be correlations between the lyrics and the music.

1.3.2 Speech tones and stress points must relate to time and metre.

1.3.3 Tempo must preferably not be fast.

1.3.4 The song must be harmonized in four parts, or orchestrated.

1.3.5 The song must be singable by choir or an assemblage of many people, even thousands together.

1.3.6 Complicated and minor harmonic progressions must be avoided.

1.3.7 A voice and piano score may be submitted.

1.3.8 The song must be uniquely South African and about South Africa that is, it must not generalise about Africa or the world.

1.3.9 The song must be derived from South African music, preferably folk music and must be in line with performance systems presently found in South Africa, e.g. choral.

Further, the sub-committee envisaged that the whole process of involving South Africans in the making of the nation's new anthem was going to take place in the following manner:

THE PROCESS

2.1 Composers and members of the public who so desire may:

2.1.1 Compose a new Anthem

2.1.2 Write and submit lyrics only

2.1.3 Collaborate in cross-cultural music

2.1.4 Make re-arrangements of existing Anthems and National songs.

2.1.5 Make other types of submissions and suggestions in writing, to the Commission.

2.2 Composers who have composed new music or have made new arrangements and wish to record with a choir or ensemble may contact SYLVIA BRIGGS - TEL. 011 397 1198 for arrangements to record.

2.3 Recorded music together with lyrics written on a separate sheet of paper may then be

submitted to the Commission in the region.

- 2.4 A TDK cassette can be submitted as demonstration tape.
- 2.5 A composition may be in tonic solfa or staff notation.
- 2.6 Submissions may include the name and address of the person/s or organisation if they so wish.
- 2.7 Anonymous submissions are welcomed.
- 2.8 The Commission on National Symbols reserves the right to use such elements from the proposals as it deems fit into submissions to the Negotiating Council.

The sub-committee set itself the following objectives and deadlines to facilitate the process of evaluation:

1. All submissions would be evaluated.
2. Criteria laid out in the main guidelines above would be used.
3. A group of music specialists would be invited to come in as Assessors, to help the sub-committee on 14 October 1993 at the World Trade Centre.
4. The Assessors would make recommendations to the sub-committee who would then make presentations to the full Commission for their evaluation on 15 October 1993.

This process did take place as originally planned and agreed upon.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Members of the sub-committee got various composers, musicians and lyricists to participate in the making of an anthem for the transitional period.

EMERGING VIEWPOINTS

There are five types of viewpoints that are emerging around the issue of a new anthem for South Africa.

1. There is a strong lobby that "Die Stem" may be maintained as a national anthem for the transition in South Africa. Some argued that with a few adaptations and changes in the text, "Die Stem" could be made acceptable to all South Africans.
2. There was a strong lobby that "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika" should be recognised as a National Anthem for the transitional period in South Africa. Some people proposed that with a few changes in the words and the removal or re-adaptation of the Sotho part, "Nkosi" can be made acceptable to all South Africans.

3. There is a strong lobby for both "Die Stem" and "Nkosi" to be officially recognised anthems for the transitional period until either one of them becomes generally acceptable or both disappear in favour of a new National Anthem for a new South Africa.
4. There is a strong lobby for something totally new, a new national anthem which will be without a history and be able to play a role of unifier. This school believes that because of their history which is characterised by confrontation and polarisation, neither "Die Stem" nor "Nkosi" would pass for a broadly accepted national anthem.
5. Some argue that a new national anthem may be composed and regional states who feel they would like to recognise either "Die Stem" or "Nkosi" or even their own new songs as second regional anthems can do so.

All arguments were well supported.

SUBMISSIONS

By 14 October 1993, there were already 119 entries for an anthem for the transitional period, including "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika". All the 119 entries were evaluated by the Sub-Committee and Assessors on the same day at the World Trade Centre. Listening facilities were provided.

At the end of the listening session there was general agreement among members of the Sub-Committee and Assessors that six new entries and both "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika", could be short-listed for final selection.

The six new entries were:

1. Volkslied - by composer Nico H Buitenweg in Afrikaans.
2. God Bless Africa - by composer E Smith in English.
3. Anthem of Life - by composer W Loubser in English.
4. God Bless South Africa - by composer Pal Roebert in English, Afrikaans, Sotho.
5. Uvunwe - by composer S J Khosa in Tsonga and English.
6. Die Volkslied - by composer A van Wyk in Afrikaans, Tswana and English.

The four assessors evaluated the shortlisted submissions independently on a form that was provided. They took into consideration the following points:

1. Patriotic potential of the song.
2. Unifying potential of the song.

3. Nation-building potential of the song.
4. South Africanness of the song (in terms of its music).
5. The ability of the song to promote the idea of a common South African culture.
6. The singability (simplicity of the melody) of the song.
7. Musical Structure of the song:
 - 7.1 Form
 - 7.2 Melody
 - 7.3 Rhythm
 - 7.4 Harmony
8. Evaluation of the authenticity of the song.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE ASSESSORS

The following recommendations were made.

The Assessors were unanimously of the opinion that although the six songs shortlisted were good, none of them could really pass for an anthem. They had different technical deficiencies, especially in musical structure and form and some lacked originality and authenticity.

The Assessors suggested that since they could not find an acceptable new anthem, they recommended "Die Stem van Suid Afrika" and "Nkosi" as dual anthems during the transitional period. They also recommended that adaptation to the text should be considered where necessary and that the text of both songs should be translated to the various languages in South Africa to allow the songs to be used by as broad a community as possible.

The original and adapted versions of both "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" will also be submitted to the Negotiating Council.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE

The sub-committee recommends:

1. That the music of "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period.
2. That the music of "Nkosi" and "Die Stem" be considered as dual anthems for the transitional period, with in practice "Nkosi" being sung followed by the music of "Die Stem".

3. That the Negotiation Council considers adaptations to the texts of these songs where necessary, to be used with the music as recommended.
4. That the following compositions and lyrics should be considered by the Negotiating Council as suitable alternatives in the following order of priority:
 - (a) Uvunwe - by S J Khosa
5. That the Negotiating Council be urged to promote a process whereby further submissions for anthems for the New South Africa should already now be stimulated. The whole exercise of searching for a new anthem should be seen as a long-drawn process which has just begun and while the two or three songs to be submitted to the Negotiating Council for consideration would be for the transitional period, composers should generally be encouraged to continue with their work of composing an anthem for new South Africa. The Sub-Committee also recommends that such a process should be sustained by the government of the day or any new government after elections.

COMMENTS BY THE SUB-COMMITTEE

Some of the submissions, lyrics and music merit recording and popularising and the Negotiating Council should consider ways and means of implementing this.

The Sub-Committee further recommends an educational drive aimed at:

- (a) Encouraging the general acceptance of the anthems by the whole spectrum of South African public.
- (b) Popularising the anthems through radio, television and types of media, including publishing them.
- (c) Facilitating the formation and foundation of a new South African nationhood.

A standing Committee to this end should, by suggestion,, be appointed by the negotiating Council, to give inputs and monitor the process.

**REPORT ON THE
COMMISSION
ON NATIONAL SYMBOLS**

REPORT ON THE COMMISSION ON NATIONAL SYMBOLS

1. Resolution on the Commission on national Symbols

The Negotiating Council adopted the following resolution on the Commission on National Symbols on 7 September 1993:

1. **Whereas** in the deliberations concerning a constitution for the transitional period, the question of national symbols will have to be addressed;
2. **And** whereas this is an extremely emotional issue that will have to be dealt with the utmost sensitivity;
3. **But** whereas cultural, artistic and technical aspects are also to be taken into account;
4. **We**, the Negotiating Council, hereby appoint :
Prof Elize Botha as Chairperson
Mrs P G P Maluleka as Vice Chairperson, and
Mr F G Brownell
Prof Lynda Gilfillan
Mr Bill Jardine
Prof P H M Kapp
Ms Barbara Masekela
Dr C Pama
Prof C J Reineke
Prof Themba Sirayi
Dr Musa Xulu
Prof Fatima Meer
Ms Rosette Nothemba Mlonzi

as members of a Commission on National Symbols to make recommendations

before the end of October 1993 to us, the Negotiating Council, or to any body that might at that time have replaced the Negotiating Council, on a national flag, a coat of arms, a seal and an anthem for the Constitution for the transitional period.

5. **The Commission is requested to -**

- 5.1 invite proposals from all interested persons or parties and to allow at least one month for submissions to be made;
- 5.2 take into account the diversity of the South African population but concentrate on the unifying function that national symbols must serve;
- 5.3 and in its recommendations submit at least four alternative flags and coats of arms.

Decisions taken on National Symbols

Only one commissioner, Mrs Barbara Masekela, was not able to take up the appointment. The Commission held its first meeting on 15 September 1993, whereafter invitations for submissions in the three categories, National Flag, Coat of Arms and National Anthem was sent out. At the request of certain members of the Commission the appointment of regional facilitators was approved in regions where it was feared that the invitation would penetrate with difficulty.

All interested persons and parties were given the opportunity to submit proposals in the three categories. The Commission received approximately 7000 submissions on a flag, 80 on the coat of arms and 120 on the national anthem.

The Commission submitted their report to the Negotiating Council for debate on 19 October 1993. Following discussion in the Negotiating Council it was proposed that five advertising/design agencies be permitted the opportunity to submit proposals on a flag. In the final analysis the Negotiating Council agreed on the following:

The Flag

Due to the time constraint and sensitivity of the issue the Negotiating Council agreed not to make a decision on the flag. The Negotiating Council recommended that both the Heraldry Council and others such as the Commission be consulted with a view to establishing what further process could be undertaken in order to do further justice to this issue. It was decided that an appropriate clause be drafted for the Constitution for the Transition to allow for the flag to be proclaimed by the State President on the advice of the Transitional Executive Council, before the April 1994 election.

The Coat of Arms

The Negotiating Council agreed that the present seal and coat of arms should remain for the transitional period.

The National Anthem

A decision was taken by the Negotiating Council that the issue of the national anthem, being a highly emotive and political one, be referred to bilateral meetings and be dealt with in due course.

GOVERNMENT PUBLICATIONS



JC208269